Sister Cities and Diaspora

From Diaspora to Potential Sister City Partnership

Kyle Campbell
Malmö Högskola
Spring 2015

One Year Thesis (IM627L)
Faculty of Culture and Society
Department of Global Political Studies
International Migration and Ethnic Relations
Supervisor: Bo Petersson
Examiner: Margareta Popoola
Acknowledgements

I’d like to thank the Celsiusgården Crew and Valter Albin for being such an amazing group of friends. Your friendship means a lot to me and this experience in Malmö has been life changing. May these friendships cultivated this year last for years onward.

I’d also like to thank my family: Susan, Peter, Brett and Chelsea Campbell for their continued support in my academic endeavours. I will forever be thankful for your positivity toward my thirst for knowledge and support during times of stress and anxiety.

Special thanks goes to my long-time friends Alisha Adams, Krystine Lawaska, and James Lawaska, who despite a great amount of distance have kept in contact with me and supported me without question. And to Sandra Toholjević, Merve Karadağ and Đorđe Đorđević for your new and continued friendship and support this year. You all are the best!


~ Kyle Peter Campbell
**Acronyms Used**

EOPT – ExplainingOutcome Process Tracing

SCI – Sister Cities International

SCP – Sister City Phenomenon

SCR – Sister City Relationship
Abstract

The sister city concept has now been around for several decades and yet there remains to be a paucity of literature dealing with the subject. Despite this unfortunate fact, there has been some literature written trying to deal with the progression of what sparked cities to try to establish sister city relationships with one another. However, this is still not enough. Diasporas have been neglected as a potential cause, which I try to remedy by employing the method of explaining outcome process tracing in a case study of the sister city relationship that began to be explored between the cities of Governador Valadares, Brazil and Framingham, United States.

Information was collected using materials such as news articles from such sources as the Metrowest Daily News and official websites such as Governador Valadares’ official city webpage, and various histories, ethnographies, and other sources were also considered especially focusing on Framingham and the Greater Boston Area, allowing for the collection of materials of both primary and secondary nature and thus an in-depth analysis.

What was found was that indeed, it is true that diaspora had a hand in influencing the negotiation of a sister city relationship between the two cities; First, the context of the Brazilian Diaspora in the United States was explained and analysed and it was found that it could be termed a proletarian labour diaspora.

Explaining outcome process tracing was then employed to inductively explain how the spark can be created, which suggested that the causal mechanism between the diaspora and the negotiations for the SCR to begin were that of an enclave forming due to the diaspora which then allowed social capital to be accumulated, allowing for Governador Valadares to grow despite Brazil’s bad economic conditions due to remittances, leading to the mayor of Governador Valadares initiating the talks.

Keywords

Sister City, Diaspora, Massachusetts, Process Tracing, Brazil, United States, Sister Cities International, Governador Valadares, Framingham
# Table of Contents

1.0 Introduction..................................................................................................................7
  1.1 Contextual Background..............................................................................................8
  1.2 Motivation for the Topic..........................................................................................9
  1.3 Aim and Research Questions...................................................................................10
  1.4 Delimitations...........................................................................................................10
  1.5 Disposition...............................................................................................................11

2.0 Literature Review.........................................................................................................12
  2.1 Discussion................................................................................................................14

3.0 Method..........................................................................................................................15
  3.1 Process Tracing........................................................................................................15
  3.2 Case-Based Research..............................................................................................17
  3.3 Qualitative Content Analysis..................................................................................18
  3.4 Constructivism........................................................................................................18
  3.5 Inductive Approach.................................................................................................19
  3.6 Material.....................................................................................................................20
  3.7 Validity.....................................................................................................................21
  3.8 Reliability...............................................................................................................23

4.0 Theoretical Framework...............................................................................................24
  4.1 Push-Pull Theories..................................................................................................24
  4.2 Labour Diaspora/Proletarian Diaspora..................................................................25
  4.3 Enclaves..................................................................................................................25
  4.4 Bridging/Bonding Social Capital..........................................................................26
  4.5 Negative Social Capital.........................................................................................27
  4.6 Remittances............................................................................................................28

5.0 Analysis.........................................................................................................................29
  5.1 The Brazilian Diaspora in the United States.........................................................29
  5.2.0 Explaining the Outcome: The Potential of a Sister City via Diaspora...........33
    5.2.1 Governador Valadares and Remittances......................................................33
    5.2.2 Brazilian Social Capital in Framingham.......................................................35
    5.2.3 The establishment of a Brazilian Enclave in Framingham...........................37
    5.2.4 Bringing It All Together...............................................................................38
    5.2.5 Alternative Explanations and Auxiliary Factors.........................................39
6.0 Conclusions and Further Research

6.1 Conclusions

6.2 Further Research

Bibliography
1.0 Introduction

Sister city organizations and their equivalents have now been around for several decades.¹ They have enjoyed rather fruitful successes; activities and exchanges of various types from cultural to educational to economic and beyond have taken place due to the connections that the sister city phenomenon forges between participants.² Sister Cities International (SCI) notes that the non-profit organization holds memberships “for 545 U.S. sister cities, counties, and states with 2,121 partnerships in 145 countries on six continents”.³ Similarly, Europe’s equivalent twin city movement operating under the Council of European Municipalities and Regions has “60 member associations from 41 of the 47 Council of Europe member countries, including all 28 member states of the European Union. Together, they represent some 150 000 municipalities and regions.”.⁴ While these organizations have provided a fertile ground for exchanges of various types ranging from cultural, to educational, to economic and more, curiously, scholarship dealing with the Sister City Phenomenon (SCP) is sorely lacking.

In defining what a sister city is in the SCP, we shall turn to SCI as they explain the concept well. A sister city relationship (SCR) can be defined as a partnership which occurs between two communities and also usually among two countries and has the intention of lasting indefinitely.⁵ It should also be officiated by the members of the municipalities or regions in question who are recognized as the highest elected or appointed officials, and this should occur from both communities upon the signing off of an official agreement.⁶

In terms of some rules and guidelines, SCI also mentions that there is no number to how many SCRs any city may have, and that the community should also be able to get involved; in terms of community member numbers, one’s SCR could have any ranging from a handful to hundreds of volunteers.⁷ In this sense, they recommend that “representatives

---

⁷ Ibid
from nonprofits, municipal governments, the private sector, and other civic organizations” to take part in the SCR as well.8

1.1 Contextual Background

The sister city concept had various antecedents which allowed for the setting of the stage for the future for the entities which we are familiar with today.9 Zelinski (1991) suggests that one of the antecedents includes “political activities of a nongovernmental nature” wherein groups such as Christian missionaries would engage with others across the pond.10 Secondly, he also suggests that another antecedent could have been the advent of world fairs in the second half of the nineteenth century since one began to see the up rise of groups promoting social causes, including businesses and scientific conventions, contributing to the inference one can make that people began to have increased interest of making agreements with others across borders, as it was profitable.11 Lastly, he suggests that international relief that has occurred around the world in response to natural disasters and related incidents requiring outside aid could have also laid the groundwork for the SCP.12

The idea of pairing cities together in an agreement, however, started to flourish in the mid-twentieth century. Two World Wars had torn the globe apart, and so people worldwide sought to press the reset button on their international relationships with one another; the SCP was thus proposed as a solution.13 European States, especially France and Germany – two former foes, began twinning their cities, leading to the creation of the Council of Municipalities of Europe in 1951.14 Across the pond, The United States was also eager to join in on peacekeeping and the settling of conflicts, also seeking these linkages through SCI which was created in 1956 under the auspices of President Eisenhower.15 Consequently, the linking of nation states worldwide began, bringing together countries which had previously been locked in combat.

8 Ibid
10 Ibid
11 Ibid
12 Ibid, p. 5.
14 Ibid
These SCRs brought forth several new characteristics to international partnerships as the world knew them. The idea of the intention to last indefinitely was one such caveat of this also reflecting the wish of states to distance themselves from conflict, as the SCP was not meant for simple one-off tasks and had an objective of increasing friendship and understanding between the two places in question.\(^\text{16}\) What was also unique was that SCRs had no usual modus operandi; each pair was different from another pair for the reasons of pairing.\(^\text{17}\) Most notably, however, was that SCRs were made without the influence of central or national governments; they were all done by their local/municipal governments as well as communities regardless of age, social status, ideology and so on.\(^\text{18}\)

1.2 Motivation for the Topic

As the researcher in this endeavour, it is helpful for one to know my motivation of researching this particular topic. I grew up in the town of Oakville in Ontario, Canada which has a boulevard named “Neyagawa”; a name which I did not pay much attention to since many Canadian towns have been named after other cities worldwide.\(^\text{19}\) Studying IMER at Malmö högskola, I came across the Sister City phenomenon and after doing a quick search of my hometown, I found out that Oakville is indeed in a sister city relationship – with Neyagawa, Japan.\(^\text{20}\) With this exciting discovery and the nature of my current studies in migration, I decided to research if migrant diasporas may have held a catalysing role with regards to cities considering sister city linkages.

It is important to note for the reader here that the analysis section (Chapter 5) will introduce the case and its context. The reason why I have chosen to introduce it there is due to avoiding repetition; I shall use the case’s contextual introduction to lay the groundwork for explaining outcome process tracing, and therefore I get right into the nitty gritty. If you wish to read the contextual background of the case now, refer to Chapter 5. What can be mentioned here is that due to the fact that the literature regarding the SCP is very limited and literature dealing with diaspora and the SCP even more so, I have chosen to look into the Framingham-Governador Valadares SCR, and for two reasons. One is for the pure fact that there is indeed a great amount of Brazilian migrants in the New England area which sparked

\(^{16}\) Zelinski, p. 3.
\(^{17}\) Ibid
\(^{18}\) Ibid
my interest in seeing if there is a Brazilian diaspora, and if so whether it could account for any SCR. The second is due to the fact that in researching Brazilians in New England, I came across a wealth of literature. This fact could allow my research to remain valid, as I could select my data more carefully. Perhaps the fact that there is a plethora of information about the case could lend a helping hand to the fact that the SCP does not have much written about it.

1.3 Aim and Research Questions

The aim of this thesis thus is to explore diasporas as a potential catalyst for motivating cities to begin to pursue sister city relationships with one another in cases where the home city happens to have established one with the host city of the diaspora. This idea therefore raises a few research questions before embarking on the project:

- How did the diaspora come about (i.e. what kind of diaspora is it?)
- Why was the host city chosen?
- How did migrant emigration affect the home city?
- Can the presence of diaspora help adequately explain why the host and home city wish to pursue SCRs?

The hope is that this paper will shed light into the idea that migrants and migration could have an effect on the sister city phenomenon, and therefore hopefully future scholars can gain insight from this and embark on research of their own dealing with such aspects as diaspora in the sister city phenomenon.

1.4 Delimitations

While I could have chosen to employ the alternative method of theory building process tracing, I chose to use the inductive path of explaining outcome process tracing (EOPT) as a means of finding out the seldom studied outcome of how diaspora can lead to cities’ interest in pursuing SCRs. This is because with theory building process tracing, theories are constructed and are seen as systematic, i.e. applicable across a variety of cases. With my research being a specific case study, and an understudied one at that, this would not

be helpful. EOPT on the other hand allows for the study of a rarely seen outcome, which is why it is preferred in my research.\textsuperscript{23} Furthermore, Beach and Pedersen mention in their own literature that theory building process tracing is seldom employed in academic literature, and therefore I shall steer clear of those uncharted waters since it is not quite known how to handle the methodology in the first place.\textsuperscript{24}

1.5 Disposition

With the sister city phenomenon now introduced and my motivations, aim and research questions, and delimitations now clear, the following section will embark upon a review of the literature discussing the means in which sister cities are established, according to the current scholarship. The third Chapter will outline my methodology chosen in order to facilitate the study; that of process tracing and case based research under the auspices of constructivism. Chapter four will then pick up on my theoretical framework used in order to aid in analysing the empirical data using such concepts as push-pull theories, labour diaspora, enclave, monetary and social remittances, bridging, bonding, and negative social capital. Chapter five will encompass my results and the analysis of them, and lastly a finishing chapter will conclude and tie the thesis together, Chapter 6.

\textsuperscript{23} Ibid, p. 18
\textsuperscript{24} Ibid, p. 16
2.0 Literature Review

Accompanying the state of paucity which plagues the literature of the sister city phenomenon is an even thinner selection of scholarship which deals with the themes and causes which act as sparks for cities to begin pursuing SCRs. This section is to therefore explore the existing literature which deals with these sparks in order to get an idea of what ideas are already out there.

Wilbur Zelinski is often hailed as the scholar who wrote the holy grail of scholarly literature dealing with the sister city phenomenon (See for example, Furmankiewicz, 2005; O’Toole, 2001; Cremer et al. 2001). Written a quarter of a century ago, he himself wrote that his 1991 work was one of the first scholarly works which dealt with the sister city phenomenon.\(^{25}\) In it, he discussed the sister city phenomenon and posed four questions, looking into how the phenomenon came about and evolved, what the spatial array of sister cities looked like, how their geographic patterns are accounted for, and what lessons regarding social and cultural geography could be posed.\(^{26}\) It was he who first noted in an academic paper in English that SCRs are each different and that it was not up to any central government for the SCR to take place, but the local/municipal one.\(^{27}\) He was also one of the first sister city scholars who took notice of the trends within various sister cities and attempted to incorporate explanatory factors into the equation.\(^{28}\) In concluding his work, Zelinski (1991) called for scholarship to be done in the area of the SCP by suggesting two approaches. One of which has motivated me to pursue a case study:

“It would be most rewarding to mount a series of case studies in a diversity of carefully chosen paired communities … to learn in detail the history of their linkage and the precise nature of current activities. Insofar as possible, such studies should delve into the effects of twinnings.”\(^{29}\)

Kevin O’Toole further developed the research dealing with factors influencing SCRs while investigating Australian and Japanese sister city linkages. In his research, he states that with the expansion of the sister city phenomenon, the roles that they play are also expanding.\(^{30}\) While initially the SCRs involved cultural exchange, many Australian cities in a

\(^{25}\) Zelinski, p. 3
\(^{26}\) Ibid
\(^{27}\) Ibid
\(^{28}\) Ibid, p. 20.
\(^{29}\) Ibid, p. 28
SCR are now looking into the economic benefits – though he cautions that this trend is not shared by all of the SCRs, as many still focus on cultural and educational correspondences.\(^{31}\)

To explain these SCRs, he provides the explanation that they have three elements: associative phases, reciprocative phases, and commercial phases.\(^{32}\) The associative phase was the first established phase, beginning in the 1960s and 1970s. The aims of these particular SCRs were that of creating international forums of friendship, exchange, and awareness and which could act as symbolic gestures.\(^{33}\) The second phase he outlines, the reciprocative phase, has many similarities to the associative phase (such as increasing international awareness and understanding), though what sets it apart from the first phase is that where the first was meant to be more of a symbolic gesture, the reciprocative phase aims to actually develop skills within the two cities.\(^{34}\) Lastly, O’Toole (2001) introduces the commercial phase which he claims came about after many local governments were pressured to help stimulate the economy.\(^{35}\) Each phase is not mutually exclusive, nor must each city go through each phase; cities can still pursue reciprocative and associative aspects, or some cities may not even emphasize one phase, as he demonstrates with Japan’s lack of interest in the commercial.\(^{36}\)

Rolf D. Cremer et al. (2001) has found similar results to O’Toole’s (2001) research by also admitting that economics has infiltrated SCRs in that, while in its infancy the SCP focused on friendship and symbolic gestures, some now have moved onto having a more economic frame of existence.\(^{37}\) However, instead of following the three phases that O’Toole (2001) suggested, Cremer et al. (2001) suggest a whole new approach, the “Integrated Approach”, where “a two-way relationship exists between commerce and culture and that it is necessary that the two facets of the sister-city relationship remain closely interwoven”.\(^{38}\) Furthermore, the authors also believe that there should not be an overemphasis on either the cultural or the economic aspect of this approach.\(^{39}\)

---

31 Ibid, p. 404
32 Ibid, p. 405
33 Ibid
34 Ibid
36 Ibid, p. 406
38 Ibid
39 Ibid
2.1 Discussion

What I would like to bring up from this review is that though the Sister City phenomenon is an international phenomenon and has received attention in the cultural/associative and economic aspects, there is seldom any mention of migrants or migratory aspects at all, which is surprising seeing as diasporas from one country could of course live in cities of another. Furthermore, the cultural/associative and economic aspects could mention diaspora (such as association due to a diaspora being present or economic SCRs due to the diaspora being present), thus would still miss the mark as it would again focus on the associative or economic aspects and not do justice for the explaining how the diaspora was the direct cause. This is why I wish to explore diaspora as a direct spark to cities wishing to pursue SCRs; justice can be given to the diaspora present there and also adequately explain how the diaspora affected the SCR without distracting misnomers being present (ie. cultural/associative and/or economic aspects parading the diaspora flag as mentioned above while giving the causal mechanism for the diaspora’s role undue justice).
3.0 Method

3.1 Process Tracing

In order to facilitate the analysis of the empirical data used in this thesis, I shall employ process tracing as the overarching methodology to do so. Process Tracing can be defined as “the systematic examination of diagnostic evidence selected and analyzed in light of research questions and hypotheses posed by the investigator. [It] can contribute decisively both to describing political and social phenomena and to evaluating causal claims.”.\(^{40}\) This method therefore enables the researcher to try to find out what the process is which links the independent variable(s), or cause(s), with the dependent variable(s), or outcome(s).\(^{41}\) Process Tracing is also helpful in exploring cases as within this methodology, the researcher is required to consider “equifinality” as well, which is the equal consideration of other paths or theories that the final outcome may have gone through or used.\(^{42}\) This not only helps reduce confirmation bias and allows the researcher to employ previous theories to test other potential ways a cause may have gone, but it also allows the researcher to eliminate the other paths which may have been possible by proving them to be inadequate or insufficient.\(^{43}\)

In being more specific, I have chosen to follow one of the three different ways in which Beach and Pedersen (2013) describe process tracing may be used in research. Their first two theories deal with theory testing and theory building process tracing;\(^{44}\) however, as I am proposing to deal with a case study and not deal with or construct a theory but merely expose a phenomenon, my research most adequately fits with what they term as the inductive path of “explaining outcome process tracing” (EOPT).\(^{45}\) This method aims to find out what a specific result is in a sole case, and should be “minimally sufficient”, in other words, “an explanation that accounts for all of the important aspects of an outcome with no redundant parts being present”.\(^{46}\) It also is used in cases where the outcome is little studied, which in the case of the SCP fits nicely.\(^{47}\) Additionally, this method also can allow for a non-systematic

\(^{42}\) Ibid, p. 207.
\(^{45}\) Ibid, p. 12
\(^{46}\) Ibid, p. 18
\(^{47}\) Ibid, p. 18
procedure (i.e. case-oriented mechanisms) within the proposed mechanism(s) and/or for the amalgamation of several mechanisms into a more combined one if necessary due to the fact that the focus is on a case and not a theory or the building of one.  

As an addendum, instead of simply assuming that a cause leads to an outcome by means of causal mechanisms (i.e. x → y), I will also follow James Mahoney’s suggestion (In Waldner) for researchers using process tracing to use a mechanism which allows for a more incremental process, such as a cause leading to an (intermediate) outcome, which could lead to another intermediate, which leads to the outcome, or “X → M (→ M →) → Y”. With this, I will be able to proceed with a more progressive analysis instead of explaining the whole, which could miss out on some detail; more finely detailed analysis can be conducted. Unlike theory building process tracing, explaining an outcome does not build a mechanism which is applicable across cases. Nonetheless, the ambition to expose the outcome to the academic world and so it can have implications which go further than the sole case, especially if another scholar decides to investigate further.

Lastly, According to Collier (2011), process tracing fundamentally is an iterative process which employs the use of four different tests in order to navigate through the theorized paths and also to validate or invalidate them and find causal inference; in order for a causal inference to be accepted, it must be confirmed as being both necessary and sufficient. He suggests the following: “Straw-in-the-Wind tests” do not need to be necessary and also they do not need to be sufficient for proving a causal inference, but passing them strengthens the chance that the inference may be correct and weakens others. “Hoop tests” can show that an inference may be necessary for an inference but cannot show sufficiency. Failing them eliminates the tested inference. “Smoking-Gun tests” verify an inference’s sufficiency but does not prove it to be necessary; it confirms the hypothesis in

---

48 Ibid, p. 19
50 Ibid. Underlined mine
51 Ibid
52 Beach and Pedersen, (2013). p. 16.
54 Ibid, p. 826
55 Ibid
56 Ibid, p. 826 - 827
question but does not disprove others. “Doubly Decisive tests” both confirm the inference in question and eliminate the alternatives. They are, however, rare and so often finding a causal inference will usually require a combination of the aforementioned three tests to prove an inference and disprove others. Lastly, “auxiliary outcomes” are tests which are not included in the main process tracing event but still could provide extremely useful information about the mechanism, making it seem more or less likely.

As mentioned above, however, the inductive path of explaining outcome process tracing is being used due to the fact that they allow for the study of a seldom studied outcome, which the concept of diaspora as a spark for pursuing SCRs is. Therefore, in order to provide support for the fact that I have provided a minimally sufficient outcome, I must attempt to look at all the angles of the outcome and see to that they are all looked into at the same time as ensure that my explanation best explains the outcome instead of alternatives which might. Thus, one can reiterate the process to show this and I shall with auxiliary causal mechanisms so as to aid in discrediting other ways.

3.2 Case-Based Research

As elaborated on above, Process Tracing employs the use of cases and case-based research in order to explore empirical data, and so it is necessary to elaborate on cases here. Though it may seem fairly obvious from its name of what a case study entails, it is nonetheless still useful to employ a formal definition. According to Chadderton and Torrance (2011), A case-study “…is an ‘approach’ to research which seeks to engage with and report the complexity of social and educational activity, in order to represent the meanings that individual social actors bring to those settings and manufacture in them.”. As opposed to case oriented research, case-based research revolves around what one can study within a sole case and how one should study it comprehensively so that patterns may be identified which can connect observations into a likely outcome. Philosophically speaking (and as I shall discuss later), case-studies imply that that social realities are constructed via social interaction

---

57 Ibid, p. 827
58 Ibid
59 Ibid, p. 827
60 Ibid p. 53
and their surrounding conditions, and therefore the researcher should first illustrate and contextualize their case in question before going ahead with their analysis.\textsuperscript{62}

### 3.3 Qualitative Content Analysis

In order to put together the methods of process tracing and case-based research in analysing the empirical material, I shall employ qualitative content analysis. This “starts with the idea of process, or social context, and views the author as a self-conscious actor addressing an audience under particular circumstances”.\textsuperscript{63} Therefore, the case’s material is seen through the lens of the researcher and is further analysed as such, allowing the researcher to analyse the material by means of how meaning was constructed as well as how new meanings could be created and used.\textsuperscript{64}

### 3.4 Constructivism

As the researcher in this thesis, I align myself as a constructivist. Constructivism can be defined as a theory of knowledge which emphasizes the fact that such knowledge must be created actively instead of simply being a static entity which must be memorized and understood.\textsuperscript{65} It is a view that dismisses objectivity due to the fact that constructivists believe that meanings are thought up and realized by society and not just discovered.\textsuperscript{66} Furthermore, it is entirely possible that meanings, even of similar phenomena, can be fashioned in several different ways.\textsuperscript{67} In a constructivists work, therefore, meanings are in the conceptual framework and so the world of this framework cannot be understood without its aid.\textsuperscript{68} With this said, my thesis is certainly influenced by constructivism as mentioned above due to the fact that I construct the causal mechanism through employing EOPT. Within the mechanism, I use the empirical data as an empirical narrative for constructing the facts of the mechanism, which later are evaluated by locating the mechanism(s).\textsuperscript{69}

According to 6 and Bellamy (2012), Constructivism is a subgroup of relativism, as it emphasizes that the everyday concerns that people come in contact with are affected and

\begin{thebibliography}{9}
\bibitem{62} Chadderton and Torrance (2011). p. 53.
\bibitem{64} Ibid
\bibitem{66} Ibid
\bibitem{67} Ibid
\bibitem{68} Ibid
\bibitem{69} Beach and Pedersen, (2013). p. 20.
\end{thebibliography}
constructed by “biases, frames, theories, and conceptual frameworks of various kinds and that these construals of their situation and experiences have important consequences for how they act and organize”. Consequently, in the relativist’s point of view, they believe that one is unable to account for that which one observes alone; they are shaped by things we recognize, label, code, and so on. In this way, statement truths are required to consistently be relative to the means in which we gather and analyze data. Furthermore, 6 and Bellamy (2012) mention that there is the notion that if one were to sort out issues at hand in the way that one’s relativistic choice tells one to, one shall code the issue at hand one way, whereas if one were to follow groupings in an institutionalized way, then they are coded another way. Essentially, the caveat is that “there is no compelling reason to accept that scientific explanations are true or false on the basis of determinate facts and scientific methods of research and inference do not alone supply such a compelling reason”.

3.5 Inductive Approach

Inductive research is said to begin with the posing of a question and rather than attempting to discover whether one’s initial hypotheses are correct or not, it aims to construct a statement about the research even though one is in the dark concerning the plausible facts about the subject. The problem of inductive research is that it may lead down an erroneous path due to the fact that patterns and hypotheses are constructed by the researcher, who may or may not miss the mark of their research. Within my research in this regard, the goal is for me to compile my research and try to find out how diaspora can motivate the spark for cities to pursue a SCR. Consequently, I will require inductive reasoning after my posed question so that I can explore my ideas. Furthermore, as we shall see below, process tracing has several means to combat the risks which come with inductive reasoning, which I shall employ in my research.

6 and Bellamy (2012), p. 57.
71 Ibid, p. 55
72 Ibid
73 Ibid
74 Ibid
75 Ibid, p. 70.
76 Ibid, p. 77.
3.6 Material

According to George and Bennet (2005), in employing the use of process tracing methods, it is imperative that the researcher utilizes “histories, archival documents, interview transcripts, and other sources”. This way, the researcher can discover the best explanation possible. Indeed, in my research I shall employ these sorts of materials as well as ethnographies in my research, allowing for both primary and secondary source use. With the use of primary and secondary materials as well as the aforementioned source variety, I hope to capture the causal mechanism through the use of authentic material and also backed up by several ethnographies in explaining the outcome. A few sources and source types, therefore, are worth elaborating on about.

The first source type I would like to talk about is the news articles employed in the research, with the Metrowest Daily News in particular. This newspaper was created in 1897, and has since been based in Framingham despite several name changes to the company, finally settling on its current name in 1998. It reports on issues within the town and some neighbouring ones as well such as Natick. I came upon this regional newspaper while researching the Brazilian diaspora in New England and was immediately intrigued; the Metrowest Daily News reported not only on the Brazilian migrants in the area extensively by reporter Liz Mineo, but she also reported on the budding SCP between Framingham and Governador Valadares quite a lot as well. This is particularly odd considering the fact that the SCP is not reported on very much neither in scholarly literature nor in every day news sources. This then sparked further exploration into links between diaspora and the SCP.

The news articles used in this thesis also give a firsthand account of how politicians and people viewed the budding SCR between the two cities – both the positives and the negatives - which was incredibly useful in exploring their SCR; it gave me clues as to what to research more deeply next. Consequently, the first-hand accounts of newspapers allowed me to gain a context of the experiences Framingham residents (both Brazilian and native) as well as some experience from the Brazilian side, as the Metrowest Daily News also sent some

79 Ibid
80 See Mineo (2004, 2006, 2008)
81 Ibid
of its employers to Governador Valadares to gain first-hand insight as well.\textsuperscript{82} In looking for clues in Brazilian sources, though this proved more difficult as I am not familiar with the Portuguese language, I managed to find some very poignant clues in sources such as the English version of Governador Valadares’ official representative website (as the site offers an English language version you may click to read) which as we shall see later in the analysis, gives several clues to the influence of the Brazilian diaspora on the city itself.\textsuperscript{83}

Governador Valadares’ website was a great start for looking into the history of the city itself, but seeing as I wished to have the larger view of the story of the Brazilian diaspora, I turned to searching for ethnographies and histories for further information. Consequently, I came upon works by Maxine Margolis and Alan P. Marcus, among others, who provided great detail into the area of study.\textsuperscript{84} Furthermore, after having read works by Liz Mineo in the Metrowest Daily News,\textsuperscript{85} I thought it to be beneficial in looking into specific ethnographies of the area, and came upon Laura Skorczeski’s and Daniel Becker’s very helpful ethnographies which focused on the immigrant experience of Brazilian migrants to Framingham and the Greater Boston Area.\textsuperscript{86} These, along with the other supplementary materials used in my research, helped form my thesis, as the combination of the different sources led me to different clues and hints while tracing the process of how diaspora affected the SCR.

3.7 Validity

According to Yin (2009), testing a subjective case study for good construct validity is difficult due to the fact that scholars worry that the researchers will be too subjective in collecting data.\textsuperscript{87} Therefore, in order to combat this, he suggests that the researcher use several sources of evidence, that the evidence should form a chain, and in the case of informants, have them review any drafts written.\textsuperscript{88} As mentioned in the material section above, process tracing allows and greatly encourages the researcher to search for data among a wide variety of sources,\textsuperscript{89} and therefore it works with the first stipulation of construct


\textsuperscript{84} See Margolis (2005) and Marcus (2009)

\textsuperscript{85} See Mineo (2004, 2006, 2008)

\textsuperscript{86} See Skorczeski (2009) and Becker (2006)


\textsuperscript{88} Ibid, p. 41

\textsuperscript{89} George and Bennet, (2005). p. 6.
validity. Gladly, as a study with good construct validity contains a chain of evidence, so too does process tracing by definition, since the researcher traces a chain of evidence to find out how a cause produces an outcome via causal mechanism.\textsuperscript{90} Process tracing can work together with construct validity’s caveat in order to produce valid scholarship. Therefore, I have confidence that my study of the Brazilian diaspora in Framingham’s influence on sparking the pursuit of a SCR will remain to be constructively valid from the aforementioned points; I shall be using a wide variety of sources and also be explaining chains of evidence.

Internal validity deals with whether a researcher’s ideas in their case about how one event led to another is correct or not, or if the researcher can efficiently prove their theory against rival ones.\textsuperscript{91} It also measures the accuracy of the inferences with which a researcher makes from their evidence. Therefore, in order to prove one’s case internally valid, it is suggested that one could build their explanations, combat alternative theories, use logic models, or pattern match.\textsuperscript{92} Inductive EOPT builds upon its explanation in a bottom up fashion and so I will be able to construct a proper explanation which also utilizes logic models, that is, “a chain of events over an extended period of time…staged in repeated cause-effect-cause-effect patterns”.\textsuperscript{93} After all of this, reiteration and auxiliary causal mechanisms will also allow me to combat the alternative mechanisms.

Lastly, external validity is a concept which concerns how one can postulate study to see whether or not it is valid in more than the case study in question.\textsuperscript{94} It is here where EOPT approaches a barrier and so the methodology must be considered. As mentioned, EOPT serves only to explain a case via providing a minimally sufficient outcome.\textsuperscript{95} Therefore, the causal mechanism discovered will not be \textit{applicable} beyond the case. This, however, is permissible, as often in EOPT “explaining-outcome studies often have theoretical \textit{ambitions} beyond the single case”.\textsuperscript{96} Therefore, since I cannot generalize the causal mechanism which I may come upon in my research, my aim is therefore only to provide a display of diaspora’s power in influencing SCRs in the hope that future scholars will consider my work and perhaps craft their own theories on how it could be generalizable beyond their case.

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{90} Ibid, p. 206.  \\
\textsuperscript{91} Yin (2009), p. 42.  \\
\textsuperscript{92} Ibid, p. 41  \\
\textsuperscript{93} Ibid, p. 149.  \\
\textsuperscript{94} Ibid, p. 43.  \\
\textsuperscript{95} Beach and Pedersen (2013), p. 16.  \\
\textsuperscript{96} Ibid, p. 19. Italics mine.
\end{flushleft}


3.8 Reliability

Reliability in a case study refers to the fact that if a scholar were to want to try to complete the researcher’s case study at a later date, they would come to the same conclusion.\(^97\) Accordingly, Yin (2009) mentions that one necessity of documenting one’s work in order for new scholars to trace it.\(^98\) Again, this is part and parcel of process tracing, as its very own name suggests. Consequently, I am confident that the research that I embark upon will be reliable for the next person to reiterate.

---

\(^{97}\) Yin (2009), p. 43

\(^{98}\) Ibid
4.0 Theoretical Framework

This section will be dedicated introducing the concepts and theories which were found could adequately explain how the cause, the Brazilian diaspora led to the outcome, the pursuit of a SCR, and in a minimally sufficient way.

4.1 Push-Pull Theories

Push-Pull theories “identify economic, environmental, and demographic factors which are assumed to push people out of places of origin and pull them into destination places.”99 This theory was first formulated by Ernest Ravenstein, who opined that one migrates due to economic reasons; the volume in which, he proposed, was measurable by looking at “distance, population size, and economic opportunities in destination and origin areas”100. Accordingly, conditions that tend to economically push emigrants to seeking better opportunities includes population growth and density, economic downturn, and problems in the political sphere.101 On the flip side, pull factors that tend to economically pull immigrants includes labour demand and land availability as well as periods of flourishing in the economic or and political sphere.102

Martin and Zürcher (2008) describe three categories of Push-Pull factors which strengthen a migrant’s motives to move; that of demand-pull, supply-push, and networks.103 Furthermore, they distinguish between economic migrants and noneconomic migrants. For example, economic migrants may be pulled by labour recruitment (demand) or pushed by reasons such as unemployment (supply), or networks could inform them of a better life via job and wage knowledge.104 A noneconomic migrant may be pulled in order to reunify family (demand), pushed due to fleeing from war (supply), or networks could help via assistance organizations or desire for experience abroad and communication.105 These importances may also change as time passes106.

100 Ibid
101 Ibid
102 Ibid
104 Ibid
105 Ibid
106 Ibid
4.2 Labour Diaspora/Proletarian Diaspora

According to Castles et al. (2014), the term “diaspora” now is in use quite often when referring to any migrant community, which is why it is now emphasized that they each have characteristics which allow them to differ from one another. We therefore first turn to Robin Cohen (1997) who defines different types of diasporas, and in particular we shall follow his ideas of what a labour diaspora is. He mentions that a diaspora may be formed from people who leave their country in order to look for employment, allowing either labour, trade, or imperial diasporas to be created. However, in order to be termed a labour diaspora, a few parameters are laid out to distinguish it from the other two. Expatriates are considered part of a labour diaspora if the following are retained: “group ties over an extended period of time, … a myth of and strong connection to homeland, … and high levels of social exclusion in the destination societies”.

John Armstrong’s (1976; in Cohen 1997) distinction between “mobilized” and “proletarian” diasporas are also useful here. While the mobilized diaspora contains people who can potentially use their linguistic, network and job skills in order to take advantage of obtaining work in more esteemed services, the proletarian diaspora contains people who do not have adequate communicative abilities and usually consists of lots of unskilled labourers with little chance of upward mobility in the social sphere.

4.3 Enclaves

The concept of enclaves will also be discussed. According to Peter Marcuse (2005), an enclave can be described as a place of spatial concentration where the members of the minority group in question come together in order to increase their economic, cultural, political, or social capital. Peach (2001), further defines enclaves as being characterized usually by the following: “dually dilute, temporary, touristic, voluntary, symbolic, residual,”

107 Castles et al. (2014), p. 42
110 Ibid, p. 58
111 Ibid
113 Peach, C. (2001). “The Ghetto and the Enclave”. In International Seminar on Segregation in the City. Cambridge: Lincoln Institute of Land Policy. p. 13. Peach mentions that only a minority of the ethnicity in question are in it, and they also compose the minority of the population in which they are associated.
and positive”. He also further defines various models of enclaves. In particular, the Voluntary Plural Model and Parachuted Suburban Model both will be helpful in this thesis. The former is a voluntary type consisting of an area highly populated, is sedentary and therefore persistent with a group, and the latter is used to denote an enclave which contains wealthier migrants who are usually “transitory sojourners”.

4.4 Bridging/Bonding Social Capital

Bridging and Bonding social capital was a concept which was introduced by Robert Putnam (2000). Regarding the concept of social capital, he claims that it is very important to explain the difference between bridging and bonding social capital. Entities which exhibit bonding social capital include such things as church groups and ethnic enclave networks, which can help in creating an air of reciprocity amongst migrants and aid in reinforcing their solidarity with one another. It can therefore be seen as more inward and exclusive, since it aims for the migrants’ identities and internal groups to continue. Bridging social capital, on the other hand, includes entities such as civil rights movements and youth groups which allow for the diffusion of information and better networking with outside resources. From this, Putnam (2000) also mentions that even if one were to have weak ties in bridging capital, these are far better than strong ties in bonding capital since bridging capital can be seen as “getting ahead” whereas bonding capital can be seen simply as “getting by”. Bridging capital allows for one to form more than one identity and bonding allows one to improve one’s “self”.

According to Bandura (1997; in Larsen et. al. 2004), individuals have more of a tendency to demonstrate collective action if they have firm social bonds and better social positions. In this way, neighbourhoods may then enjoy bonding social capital, which if higher, can also make the chances of their participation in beneficial social events increase.

---

114 Ibid.
115 Ibid, p. 15
116 Ibid, p.16.
118 Ibid
119 Ibid
120 Ibid
121 Ibid
122 Ibid, p. 23
123 Ibid
such that they go beyond tasks which solely benefits their own self-interests. More than this, they are also more likely in participate in events which solve issues as well. This caveat can be seen as an attempt to go beyond bonding and also move into bridging social capital. It can be therefore said that having bonding social capital is a prerequisite which is needed for the accumulation of bridging social capital.

According to Bram Lancee (2012), the very basis of the concept of bonding capital lies in network closure due to the fact that contributors in these closed off networks have ties with each other. He thus further distinguishes between individual bonding social capital and collective bonding social capital, where individual is seen as the resources retained by the members of the network which, depending on circumstance, could become useful for the individual, and collective is seen as the batch of capital which an ethnic community retains that could become useful to everyone who is a member within the community. Bridging social capital is can be seen as links between members of other groups which are more “egg shell-like” in that they are both thinner and have the potential for more issues. They can also be broken down between individual and collective. Individually, bridging social capital is defined as the batch of capital which an individual’s contacts within his/her network hold and could become useful to him/her, though depending on the relationships between the two individuals. Collectively, bridging social capital can be defined as the batch of capital which, though not actually owned by members of the community, it could become available to all of them, though depending on context.

4.5 Negative Social Capital

Negative social capital is a term used to describe the process of how institutions meant for positively influencing capital gains can actually do the reverse; institutions such as

---

125 Ibid
126 Ibid 65
127 Ibid
129 Ibid
130 Ibid
131 Ibid, p. 27
132 Ibid
133 Ibid
legal protection, welfare, and education centres aiming to be inclusive for migrants end up marginalizing them, creating suspicion and exclusion.134

4.6 Remittances

Alongside monetary remittances, according to Levitt (1998), Social remittances are “local-level, migration-driven forms of cultural diffusion…the ideas, behaviours, identities, and social capital that flow from receiving to sending country communities”.135 They are an important type of remittance due to the fact that they allow even non-migrants a chance to picture environments and places despite the fact that they are actually places and environments that they have never been to; in this sense they are important for immigrant transnationalism as well as for displaying any of the effects that migration has to attention, and lastly because they could also help in developing the communities of the home country from where they came from or the communities they currently live abroad in.136 In addition to this, due to the fact that migrants often utilize similar methods of going abroad as their predecessors or friends and family had done, members of the community involved in policy making could make it easier for future migrants with information obtained by social remittance.137

136 Ibid, p. 926.
137 Ibid, p. 927.
5.0 Analysis

This section will be devoted to presenting and analysing the empirical data researched. The first section will express a contextual background of the history between Brazil and the United States and the context of migration between the two countries. The next section will then kick off the process tracing methodology by presenting the empirical facts, which will be analyzed independently and in a bottom up detective-like fashion in order to maximize detailed analysis. After the causal mechanism is discovered, the third section will look at the causal mechanism as a whole and run through it to show the reader clarity. The fourth section will present reasoning as to why alternative theories are not adequate in being used to explain this particular outcome. The last section deals with auxiliary outcomes which helps explain the constructed theory and also helps in discounting other alternatives to the outcome, aiding in providing a minimally sufficient outcome necessary for this sort of process tracing.

5.1 The Brazilian Diaspora in the United States

Brazil’s and the United States’ comradery begins during around World War II, due to the fact that areas such as Governador Valadares had deposits of mica and iron which were important for creating war tools and radios.\textsuperscript{138} As a result of this, American companies began to set up shop in Valadares and Rio Doce, bringing medical personnel and engineers to ensure safety but also maximize the production that could go on.\textsuperscript{139} It was after the war had ended, when the mining heads of the companies began to return back to the United States that some Brazilians decided to accompany them so that they may work abroad in jobs such as domestic servants that has been considered as the starting point of Brazilian social networks.\textsuperscript{140}

Despite the aforementioned social networks perhaps beginning, Brazil still was not known as a country of emigration; in fact, quite the opposite: it had been known as having “the fastest economic growth in the world for over a century, spanning from 1870 to 1980”.\textsuperscript{141} For many, the country was seen as a place of opportunity. That is, until around the 1980s. Becker (2006) mentions that unfortunately, in the second half of the twentieth century

\textsuperscript{139} Ibid, p. 24
\textsuperscript{140} Ibid
\textsuperscript{141} Ibid, p. 13.
things started to become difficult; in 1964 President Joao Goulart’s government was violently overthrown by Humberto de Alencar Castello Branco and this threw Brazil into two decades of rule through various military dictatorships.\textsuperscript{142} He also mentions that though Brazil’s economy grew between 1968 and 1974, wage gaps increased and two oil crises in the 1970s (1973 and 1979) led the country into a debt crisis of more than 75 billion US dollars, with two thirds of the country’s export income going to interest payments and societal income decreasing by 5 percent.\textsuperscript{143} Consequently, over a million citizens of Brazil emigrated due to the abysmal economic situation by the end of the late 1980s,\textsuperscript{144} and by 1994 the country’s inflation rate climbed to 2500 percent.\textsuperscript{145}

As of 2002 it was approximated that perhaps around 1.2 million Brazilian citizens migrated to the United States.\textsuperscript{146} One reason for this great wave to America was due to the fact that the wage difference between Brazil and the United States was astronomical: In Massachusetts, the minimum wage in the 1980s was 1080 USD per month; In Brazil, it was (an equivalent of) 163 USD.\textsuperscript{147} Even almost thirty years later, this was still the case; in a report by Liz Mineo (2008), for example, she interviewed Brazilian migrant Alex Vidal who explained that he paid close attention to the exchange rate between the Brazilian real and the American dollar.\textsuperscript{148} He was about to return home since the American dollar had been weakening, until the exchange rate went from 1.5 USD to 2.3 USD, prompting him to change his mind.\textsuperscript{149}

Quite clearly, Push-Pull theory can be used to explain Brazilian migration to the United States. With Brazil experiencing huge inflation and poor economic prospects push factors, many migrants have decided to migrate to the United States due to the fact that wages are higher, a pull factor. However, as the Dollar waxes and weans, so do Brazilian migrants,

\textsuperscript{142} Ibid, p. 11 \\
\textsuperscript{143} Ibid, p. 13 \\
\textsuperscript{146} Marcus (2009), p. 173. \\
\textsuperscript{149} Ibid
if they feel that the benefits of being abroad wean as well. The Brazilians are certainly economic migrants who are pushed due to poor wages, and still this did not change even thirty years later after the 1980 crisis. One can certainly see as well that Vidal considered the relative poverty he would be in if he went back home versus stayed in Framingham. This can be seen in another article by Mineo (2006) as she reports on how even bad odds do not deter migrants.\footnote{Mineo, L. (2006). “Day 2: Long Odds Don’t Deter Immigrants”. The Metrowest Daily News. 18 December.} Between the months of February in 2004 and October in 2005, there was a monumentally large demand for Mexican passports by Brazilians due to the fact that they desired to use them in order to eventually go to the United States.\footnote{Ibid} Therefore, despite the fact that their attempts to enter the United States were, of course, illegal, once the easier opportunity showed itself, potential migrants jumped at the opportunity.\footnote{Ibid} When Mexico once again reinstated visa required status, the demand for the passport plummeted.\footnote{Ibid} Consequently, it can be inferred that with the Brazilian economy pushing them away and the fact that the easier time getting to the United States despite being illegal still attracted many, it can be said that the American economy was a big pull factor.

Let us now look at the Brazilian exodus to the united states as potentially being defined as a diaspora. As mentioned in the theory section, in order to be a diaspora there must be “group ties over an extended period of time, … a myth of and strong connection to homeland, … and high levels of social exclusion in the destination societies”.\footnote{Cohen, p. 57.} If we look at Framingham, one can notice quite a bit of social exclusion. In 2003, the Rizoli Brothers, well known in Framingham for being anti-immigrant extremists, founded the Concerned Citizens and Friends of Illigal Imigration Law Enforment (CCFIILE) group, which aims to specifically target and harass Brazilian migrants.\footnote{Anti-Defamation League. (2015). Jim and Joe Rizoli. <http://archive.adl.org/nt/exeres/7f918ae0-1eeb-4037-b83a-46c92344a4a7.db7611a2-02cd-43af-8147-649e26813571.frameless.html>.} They have gone so far as to claim such things as "Framingham has been turned into a Brazilian slave camp…[It] has been raped by Brazilians.".\footnote{Ibid} Furthermore, CCFIILE also has had their members spy on what they believe are day labor pick-up sites and have held street protests, such as when they protested agains the migrant community holding a peaceful celebration after the June 2006 soccer team won a game in the World Cup.\footnote{Ibid}
There is also a very strong myth and connection to their homeland. Brazilians are very proud of their home country, and loath the fact that a majority of Americans lump them together with Hispanic South Americans.\textsuperscript{157} They will often distance themselves from the Hispanic Americans and even claim that they are better. Social media also plays a large role in keeping Brazilian migrants up to date, and they certainly do so it is “not just a cultural memory in the minds of Brazilians abroad but almost a lived experience”.\textsuperscript{158} In Framingham this is quite clear; Brazilian flags speckle downtown Framingham as do signs in Portuguese.\textsuperscript{159}

In Framingham, there are also efforts seen by the community in order to try to come together. For example, Framingham groups such as BRAMAS BRAzilian AMerican ASsociat ion (Capitalization to demonstrate the acronym) exist which aim to “organize the Brazilian community in order to build an identity in the American Society”.\textsuperscript{160} Religion has also allowed Brazilian migrants to come together over time. For example, Levitt (2004) interviewed a migrant who elaborated on how though he saw himself permanently in Framingham, he still identified with his Brazilian roots:\textsuperscript{161}

“The church there allowed him to realize that he needed to help: “when the police want to meet with the Brazilian community to understand us better or there are meetings to try to get people driver's licenses … I go. My God tells me to be here and to help out”.\textsuperscript{162}

Consequently, the fact that the Brazilian migrant community follows the three qualifications as stated above, it can be seen as a labour diaspora. What is more, according to Margolis, Governador Valadares in particular tended to send Brazilian migrants who appeared to be “less educated and more likely to be from lower-middle class or working class families”.\textsuperscript{163} Consequently, the community can be identified as a proletarian diaspora as well.

\textsuperscript{157} Margolis, p. 613.
\textsuperscript{158} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{159} Ibid
\textsuperscript{162} Ibid
\textsuperscript{163} Margolis, p. 610.
Now that we have established a context to the Brazilian labour diaspora, which can sometimes be termed a proletarian diaspora as well if it contains migrants from Governador Valadares, let us proceed with tracing a potential causal mechanism between the diaspora and how it could have led to the establishment of the sister city.

5.2.0 Explaining the Outcome: The Potential of a Sister City via Diaspora

5.2.1 Governador Valadares and Remittances

In this section we shall now embark upon the task of explaining the outcome of how the Brazilian diaspora led to Framingham and Governador Valadares pursuing a SCR with one another. This section will therefore provide the academic detective work in order to build explanations (causal mechanisms) which are minimally sufficient in explaining the cause leading to the outcome.

Let us begin with what is known: we know from the above section that there is a diaspora in Framingham, and we know that the sister city relationship began being pursued. Though formal talks for pursuing a SCR began in 2004, Metrowest Daily News reporter Liz Mineo reported that Joao Fassarella, the mayor of Governador Valadares that initiated discussions of establishing a sister city, first thought of bringing up the subject 5 years prior to the talks, after he had visited Framingham.164 His reasoning for the need to pursue sister city relations is quite clear in a Framingham interview:

"As a mayor [of Governador Valadares], one has to take care of the citizens in his city, but many people in Valadares depend on people who are working and living in Framingham… I don't encourage people to come here [to Framingham] because migration brings many difficulties. Families break apart, parents leave their children and husbands live apart from their wives. But since people have moved here [to Framingham], we have to help them and the people that are left behind. The agreement will help both communities take better advantage of the contributions made by Brazilians here and there."165

This passage presents a number of insights. First of all, Fassarella’s mentioning of how he does not encourage emigration is part and parcel of the Brazilian ethos; Brazilians are proud of their nation and so the admission that Fassarella makes how he does not encourage emigration leads one to believe that Governador Valadares’ relationship with Framingham is very important and that that the SCR could greatly aid in the “necessary evils” of migrants

165 Ibid, Italics mine.
being abroad for better economic predicaments. Furthermore, in mentioning how the SCR would benefit both communities, he brings up the important point that the diasporic community has had a profound impact on both Framingham and Governador Valadares. Since he mentions how people in Valadares are dependent on their kin in Framingham, let us first examine Governador Valadares’ development and how it may have motivated Fassarella and others into pursuing this SCR.

With Brazil’s economic downturn, Valadares was hit hard economically as well. Beginning in the 1960s, Valadares experienced the start of a depletion of the available natural resources, causing a lot of municipal economic capital to decrease as the city had been established due to these natural resources. Rio Doce’s sugar cane company “Thistle” closed as well in the 1970s. Since the city had focused on these, it did not develop an entrepreneurial culture which threatened the city.

Despite all of this and unlike many of the surrounding cities, over the next few decades the city managed to survive and even experience demographic growth. With this peculiarity, I shall establish this as the partial empirical fact leading to the SCR in the analysis and use it as the starting point of finding a mechanism to the final outcome. The feat of Governador Valadares flourishing is owed to the remittances sent home by kin. In an article by James Brooke (1990), it was documented that several high-rise buildings had begun to appear in the city, including one nick-named the “Empire State Building”, and many teenagers were seen with many traditionally American cultural items such as Mad Magazine. One of the clearest indicators of the importance of remittances in the city, however, was when “money exchange shops started to outnumber tractor dealerships”. In fact, Governador Valadares’ official city website states that:

“In 1993, it has been estimated that about 27,000 [V]aladarenses had emigrated abroad, most of them in the range between 16 and 35 years. The dollars sent by immigrants boosted the construction industry, trade and led to the opening of

---

166 Margolis, 613.
168 Ibid
169 Ibid.
170 Ibid.
171 Ibid
173 Ibid
many businesses. These resources were fundamental to maintain the dynamics of the economy in the years 1980 and 90.\textsuperscript{174} (Italics mine)

The Brazilian diaspora was not limited to the United States as it included other countries such as Portugal and Japan. However, Their website using the term can only serve to suggest the importance of American remittances for the city’s economy, as can the fact that the city is openly admitting this fact.\textsuperscript{175} Consequently, Fassarella’s comments about the importance of Valadarenses in Framingham point directly to the role of remittances, which can thus be seen as the causal mechanism between Valadas’ growing economy and his interest in pursuing the SCR.

Within this context, monetary remittances should not be the only thing considered. The Brazilian migrants also send social remittances back home. Upon their return, Brazilian migrants bring their stories of their experiences being abroad as well as material objects, ideas, and identities.\textsuperscript{176} As a result of this, non-migrants and soon-to-be migrants can use this information to mould their perceptions of the United States as a receiving community. The above example demonstrated by Brooke (1990) is a good example of this, as the fact that the teenagers were reading American cultural items such as Mad Magazine and with naming one of the buildings after the American Empire State Building, these Brazilians will have an idea in their head which would have been influenced by stories, ideas, and cultural items remitted to them by their family and friends.\textsuperscript{177} If they chose to migrate to Framingham as so many youths do from Valadares, this will have clear implications for them for when they arrive on American soil. Social remittances could have therefore also motivated Fassarella to want to pursue a SCR. This is a smoking gun test.

5.2.2 Brazilian Social Capital in Framingham

With remittances established as the partial causal mechanism of the SCR, we can now move backward. How were Brazilian migrants able to be so successful in accumulating and sending remittances? This section will explore this. According to Marcus (2009), Brazilians continue displaying their country’s pride even while being abroad. This allows them to outwardly convey their “Brazilianness” and solidify their devotion and adherence to their

\textsuperscript{174} Espíndola, (2015)  
\textsuperscript{175} Ibid  
\textsuperscript{176} Brooke (1990)  
\textsuperscript{177} Ibid
As a result of this, Brazilian business owners in Framingham will display flags in their shops to proudly display this as well as to tell any passerby that their services are available in Portuguese. Marcus shows this by demonstrating that many migrants are “engaging simultaneously in multi-faceted activities, affiliations, and social and business practices” such as stores, beauty salons, newspapers, TV networks, restaurants, and religious affiliations.

According to Sales (2004), the Brazilian diaspora can be termed an enclave. This has several implications for bonding social capital, according to Skorczeski (2009), the city suffered beginning in the 1960s due to neighboring towns such as Natick developing into more commercial areas. Downtown Framingham’s economic situation began to stagnate, and small businesses began to close, losing businesses both small and large. The Dennison and General Motors Plants are two examples of large corporations which shut down. This led to the area becoming more and more ghost town-like and increasingly dangerous with the surfacing of drugs and crime. Luckily for the area, in the early 1980s a revitalization project went on to try to renew the area. Several Brazilian migrants opened businesses downtown which led the area to become a more prosperous state. For Brazilians in Framingham, this allows for a sense of community bonding capital as not only does it make them feel proud about their achievements abroad, they are doing it as a community which has led to the proliferation of several businesses and culture.

Consequently these means of income allow Brazilians not only for bonding social capital, but also bridging capital. Sales (2004) mentions that in Framingham, there are several other minority ethnic groups present and have also found a means to an end in creating their own businesses. The Brazilian owners and the other owners do not dispute over customers, however; instead, they work together, even patronizing each other. This was evident as Sales (2004) saw the fact that an Asian diner that was situated between two Brazilian businesses

178 Marcus, p. 184.
179 Ibid.
180 Ibid.
183 Skorczeski, p. 11.
184 Ibid, p. 12
185 Ibid, p. 15
186 Ibid, p. 16
187 Sales, p. 58.
offered dinner with live Brazilian music on occasions, and even advertised the occasions in both Portuguese and English.\textsuperscript{188} Therefore, by collecting social capital by bonding within their community and also extending their reach of capital by teaming up with other minority ethnic groups, the Brazilian diasporic community have constructed ways to maximize the profit they obtain while working abroad in Framingham. In this way, they can maximize their remittances which they may send back to Governador Valadares and help their friends and family. This part’s causal mechanism therefore can be defined as bridging and bonding social capital which explains why the Brazilian diasporic community obtains their economic and social capital which they can then remit back home. This is a hoop test.

5.2.3 The establishment of a Brazilian Enclave in Framingham

In the previous section we discovered that it was the fact that the community was an enclave that allowed for the significant amount of social capital to flow within the Brazilian migrant community. This section will therefore trace what led to the establishment of the Brazilian community into an enclave and how and why this happened. The Brazilian enclave is somewhat of an anomaly because it can be somewhat difficult to define them. According to Ceri Peach’s models of enclaves, the Brazilian community could fit into parts of the definitions of both voluntary plural enclaves as well as parachuted suburban enclaves.\textsuperscript{189} This is due to the fact that the Brazilian community in Framingham is certainly symbolic as the Brazilians hold onto their heritage quite tightly and culture is seen everywhere, also allowing it to be a tourist area, especially as they have revamped the downtown.\textsuperscript{190} However, not all of the Brazilian migrants – in fact, a large portion of them do not – have a desire to remain in situ.\textsuperscript{191} Downtown Framingham can also be termed as the centre of the ethnic group, further complicating the fit of the definition of voluntary plural enclave to the Brazilians. However, the parachuted suburban model can also account for some but not all of the Brazilian experience. Framingham did urbanize quite quickly upon the arrival of the Brazilian community and a large portion of Brazilian migrants identify as being sojourners – indeed, some like the term “economic refugee”.\textsuperscript{192} However, the migrants arriving in Framingham are largely from Governador Valadares which suggests that they are not affluent migrants by any

\textsuperscript{188} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{190} Skorczeski, pp. 11 – 16.
\textsuperscript{191} Marcus, p. 179.
\textsuperscript{192} Margolis, p. 602.
means. According to Sales (2004), this is due to the fact that the Brazilians are only very recent emigrants from Brazil and therefore not enough time as elapsed to allow “a number of metamorphoses that can be observed among other migrant communities in the United States, all of which are now into at least the second or third generations” Consequently, the Brazilian diaspora, being newer, led to this peculiar enclave. We have therefore connected our final intermediate fact to the diaspora and have potentially completed the causal mechanism. Let us then revisit the entire process from top down to inquire if it flows as a potential causal mechanism. This is a smoking gun test.

5.2.4 Bringing It All Together

The purpose of this final section is to bring together the previous three sections and connect them to formulate the final causal mechanism as a whole which led the cause, the Brazilian diaspora, to lead to and arrive at the outcome, the Framingham and Governador Valadares’ interest in pursuing a SCR with each other. The previous sections worked backwards due to creating the mechanisms bottom up, and so for the sake of clarity to show the process in action, this section will briefly run through it.

The Brazilian diaspora in Framingham, Massachusetts is a proletarian labour diaspora which led to the formation of an enclave due to the fact that the Brazilians, being late to the international scene regarding diaspora, created an enclave which was much more difficult to characterize. Furthermore, the fact that pre-existing conditions allowed for the development of the enclave allowed it to flourish. This enclave then allowed for the Brazilian diasporic community to accumulate social capital in the form of bonding capital (that is, capital gains from bonding as a community) as well as in the form of bridging capital by taking part in such things as patronizing each other’s businesses. This social capital accumulation allowed for the sending of a wealth of remittances, both in monetary and social form, allowing Governador Valadares to become a prosperous city despite the fact that all other surrounding cities were not doing well, as with the Brazilian economy. This led to people, especially Joao Fassarella, seeing that Governador Valadares needed the remittances in order to continue to prosper, and consequently motivated him in deciding on looking into the Sister City project.

---

193 Margolis, p. 610.
194 Sales, p. 127.
also citing Framingham’s need for the Brazilian community there from how Downtown flourished after their arrival.

The first test is a smoking gun test as the enclave only slightly suggests that it it’s the cause. Social capital leading to the allowance of remittances can be seen as a hoop test as it is relevant in that it does allow for remittances but not sufficient in the explanation. The remittances causing the step to the SCR is a smoking gun test as it affirms the sufficiency of suggesting the link but is not necessarily relevant to the cause; but with all three tests done, one can see how that diaspora is indeed the causal mechanism.

5.2.5 Alternative Explanations and Auxiliary Factors

This section will deal with relating our created causal mechanism between the diaspora and pursuit of an SCR as the best plausible outcome, and how alternative potential outcomes, if any, are inadequate in explaining the outcome. Firstly, I would like to argue that one of the reasons why I decided to use the method of inductive EOPT was due to the fact that this outcome of the pursuit of a SCR has been to my knowledge seldom studied. In the other process tracing methods, theory testing process tracing, theory building process tracing, and also deductive EOPT, one must evaluate their causal mechanisms against competing ones in order to prove theirs is correct.¹⁹⁵ This is harder to do in my case under the circumstances of exploring a hardly studies outcome, but as you will see below, I reiterate some processes in order to prove this point.

Along with the causal mechanism adopted above, there are in fact other auxiliary mechanisms which aid in providing evidence for the diaspora idea. The first factor I would like to discuss is the reception of the Brazilian community and the idea of the SCR to other citizens of Framingham. Bringing up the famous Rizoli Brothers once again, if we see the events of their discrimination, such as calling the Brazilians names such as accusing them of turning the city into a “Brazilian slave camp”¹⁹⁶ as a test of the SCR being either part of the cultural/associative, econ, or diasporic reasoning, it favours the diasporic reasoning as if the associative is supposed to promote friendship and knowledge of one another,¹⁹⁷ and since citizens are generally involved with SCRs, some of Framingham’s residents clearly either are

¹⁹⁵ Beach and Pedersen, p. 14 - 19
¹⁹⁶ Sanchez, 2008.
¹⁹⁷ Sister Cities International, 2015b
not at all educated on the issue or openly despise the immigrants.\(^{198}\) This lends credibility to the diasporic community being behind the SCR therefore because it would be in their interest for the aid of sending remittances back to Governador Valadares, and it is not in the interest of the community in general. This fact acts as a straw-in-the-wind test which makes the diasporic reason look more probable and cultural/associative and economic less so.

Another straw-in-the-wind test that lends credibility to the diasporic community as being behind the SCR can be identified with the timing of the SCR being established. The SCR was being pursued in 2004, which is some years after the great Brazilian migration, lending credibility to the diaspora reason.\(^{199}\) If the SCR was established more due to associative reasons, it most likely would have been established long ago. For example, most SCRs between countries who were allies during WW II paired when the phenomenon began.\(^{200}\) This did not occur between Framingham and Governador Valadares even though they were pairs that as we saw above enjoyed many benefits.

A third auxiliary outcome which goes against the economic idea is when Brazilian migrants and diaspora members rejected a proposal by Valadares. In Valadares, a trust fund was set up in order to allow for ease of transfer or remittances.\(^{201}\) However, migrants seemed to distrust this phenomenon and therefore it was rejected. This reduced economic reasoning’s credibility due to the fact that the migrants in Framingham do not like an economic proposal and therefore probably would rather continue their unofficial way of sending remittances, that is via remittances.\(^{202}\) Clearly, the diaspora reason for the SCR is better in this case.

Yet another auxiliary causal mechanism can be seen as the negative social capital generated from the within and surrounding the community. Even though the Brazilian migrant community aided in improving downtown Framingham and succeeded in doing so, many Framingham natives viewed their efforts as an erosion into American society which caused significant negativity to be felt toward the Brazilian community.\(^{203}\) This was also further amplified with programmes such as the ESL programme offered by Framingham, as it

\(^{198}\) Sanchez, 2008.
\(^{199}\) Mineo, 2004.
\(^{200}\) Furmankiewicz, p. 146.
\(^{202}\) Brooke (1990)
reinforced the negative stereotype that the Brazilians were eroding American values. Only as a straw-in-the-wind tests, we can perhaps infer indirectly that Joao Fassarella was perhaps inferring this when he made the comment that the Sister City could aid in bettering the communities together.

Ibid

Mineo (2004)
6.0 Conclusion and Further Research

6.1 Conclusion

In this study we have discussed several aspects of the SCP. Beginning with the impact that Sister City-like relationships have had on cities and discussing the history of the movement, it was noted that scholarship dealing with the SCP was incredibly lacking. Motivated to study how diaspora can spark interest in the pursuit of SCRs due to the city of my upbringing, I then discuss the key literature which deals with the establishing of SCRs; that of Zelinski (1991), O’Toole (2001) and Cremer et al. (2001).

Zelinski’s (1991) work is extremely important due to the fact that his was one of the first scholarly works on the SCP. Not only discussing the history, he also laid out trends which characterized SCRs and laid the groundwork for successive scholarly articles. He also called for more scholarship to be done on the SCP, which I hope to have contributed. O’Toole (2001)’s work was important due to his contribution to explaining the roles of Sister City Type Relationships and how their roles have evolved from the start of the phenomenon to the turn of the century, citing associative, reciprocative, and commercial roles. Cremer et al. (2001), while agreeing with O’Toole’s initial associative roles and how commercial roles have now come to the forefront, suggests an integrative approach of reciprocity of the two being important in order to sustain SCRs.

Chapter Three explored the use of process tracing and EOPT. EOPT was important in this as it allowed for the exploration of a little-explored outcome; precisely the kind which was studied. This was done in the context of a case, which EOPT is based around as well within its methodology of study. Because I was constructing the minimally sufficient outcome within the case context, I can be seen as a constructivist, since I was constructing the world in which I was dealing with. By extension, I was also a relativist since my construction was relative to my experiences, and I was also subjective since I was the one selecting the evidence.

Chapter Four explored the theory which I employed after my empirical research in order to help explain the context of the Brazilian emigration to the United States and Framingham, and guide along the empirical facts of the proposed causal mechanism. The concepts of push-pull theory, labour diaspora, and proletarian diaspora were first employed in
a qualitative analysis of the context which led to the Brazilian diaspora. This was done to gain more insight into the phenomenon and set up for EOPT. The concepts of enclave, bridging and bonding social capital, negative social capital, monetary remittances, and social remittances would be applied next in EOPT.

In embarking upon discovering if diaspora could be a spark in creating interest for cities to pursue SCRs, in Chapter Five it was decided to explore the case of Framingham and Governador Valadares’ process of negotiating a SCR. First, the context of the Brazilian Diaspora in the United States was explained and analysed; it was found that due to economic turmoil, Brazilians emigrated to countries such as the United States and their conditions could be elaborated on by utilizing push-pull theory. Their experiences also satisfied the terms of being termed a labour diaspora. In looking even closer, it was found that Brazilian migrants from Governador Valadares also satisfy the conditions for being termed a proletarian diaspora.

Explaining outcome process tracing was then employed to inductively explain how the spark can be created, and this was done at first in parts to aid in clarity and maximize explanation. Going from bottom up, it was first found, after stating the outcome of Governador Valadares’ mayor attempting to seek an SCR, that Governador Valadares’ development due to remittances and social remittances led to the mayor seeking the relationship. The next puzzle piece was then to search for what conditions in Framingham allowed for such remittances to be sent, and it was found that Framingham’s Brazilian enclave allowed for bonding and bridging social capital accumulation which gave way for the remittances. To explain the formation of the Brazilian enclave, the last puzzle piece was laid out, as the Brazilian diaspora could account for this fact using case-specific mechanisms as well. Finally, a section was devoted to explaining the auxiliary outcomes which could aid in describing the outcome as minimally sufficient and also help discount alternative theories.

6.2 Further Research

From the results and conclusions reached in this paper, it is my hope that I demonstrated enough an example of how diaspora may influence the motivations of the home city and host city in a positive way so that they look into SCRs. Since Explaining Outcome process tracing can only do as its name implies however, the causal mechanism elaborated on was merely to expose the diaspora phenomenon in the context of Sister Cities. Perhaps, then,
this can motivate future scholars into looking into a theorized causal mechanism which could be applied across cases. Hopefully I have also contributed to Zelinsky’s wishes.
Bibliography


