Understanding Connectivity:

Cosmopolitan Ethics, Faith-based Organizations and Formation of Networks in the Israeli–Palestinian Conflict

Noora Kauppila
Abstract

The aim of this study is to establish a comparative perspective of the Church of Sweden and Finn Church Aid (FCA) as development actors. The research will concentrate on the study of the similarities and differences of their methods and approaches. As case studies I will focus on the principles of the EAPPI program and Labeling the Origins campaigns. Methodologically, I shall study the interrelatedness of the practices and methods of specific actors with values and ethical positions and, especially, concentrate on the discussions dealing with discourses of cosmopolitanism, Christian ethics and their overlaps. Narratives are used to complement discursive analysis. The theoretical framework consists of various cosmopolitan theories that are applied to analyze the ideological aspects of the faith-based organization’s methods. The ethical aspects are presented from different perspectives to create an understanding of the diversity of how cosmopolitanism can be comprehended in relation to Christianity. The comparative perspective has created an understanding of how networks are formed and how the same themes are present in different organizations but guided by different discursive formations. This also points towards the understanding that the perspective of networks is more significant than countries or actors.

Keywords: Christianity, Cosmopolitanism, Ethics, Israeli–Palestinian conflict, The Church of Sweden, Finn Church Aid, Volunteer work
1 Introduction

1.1 Research Problems 1
1.2 Relevance of the Subject 2

2 Background

2.1 The Israeli–Palestinian Conflict and the Illegal Israeli Settlements 2
2.2 The Ecumenical Accompaniment Programme (EAPPI) and Labeling the Origins Campaign 4
2.3 The Church of Sweden and Finn Church Aid 5

3 Previous Research on Christian Ethics and Approaches to Humanitarian Aid and Development Work 6

4 Methodology 9

4.1 Discourse and Narrative Analysis 9
4.2 Comparative Study and Normative Framework 10
4.3 Material 11

4.3.1 Interviews 11
4.3.2 Reports 12
4.3.3 Theological Documents 13
4.3.4 Internet and Other Media 14

5 Theoretical Framework 14

5.1 Distinctive Definitions of Cosmopolitanism 14
5.2 Cosmopolitan Ethical Aspects 15
5.3 Rights, Responsibilities and Law in Institutional Framework 17
5.4 The Actors of Justice 18

6 Analysis 19

6.1 Ethics of Development Work 19
6.2 EAPPI 23

6.2.1 The Citizen of the World 24
6.2.2 Come and See 25
6.2.3 Advocacy Work 26
6.2.4 A Cross in the Back of the Working Vest 28

6.3 Institutional Approach: This is Not a No Man’s Land 28
6.4 Campaigns against Israeli Goods Produced in the Occupied Palestine Territories 32

6.4.1 FCA: Conscious Purchasing Decisions Are Defending Human
Rights

6.4.2 The Church of Sweden: Act against Occupation in Palestine

6.4.3 Understanding Connectivity

6.4.4 A Cosmopolitan Cause?

7 Conclusion

References

Glossary of Abbreviations

Appendix 1: Themes of the Interviews
1 Introduction

The aim of my study is to establish an analytical and empirical comparison of the Church of Sweden and Finn Church Aid (FCA) as development actors. The research will concentrate on the study of the similarities and differences of their methods and approaches, as well as partners and networks related to their work. I will illustrate and analyze various actors’ stances and policies towards illegal Israeli settlements in the occupied Palestinian territories as a primary example. Moreover, I will consider how the conflict is approached through the awareness raising campaigns advocating consumer choices of the Israeli goods produced in the occupied territories. In addition, I will study the structures and practices of the actors participating in the Ecumenical Accompaniment Programme in Palestine and Israel (EAPPI), which brings internationals to the West Bank to experience life under occupation and share their experience through diverse media.

1.1 Research Problems

Methodologically, I shall study the interrelatedness of the practices and methods of specific actors with their values and ethical positions, based on theories of social sciences, especially peace and conflict studies. I will especially concentrate on the discussions dealing with discourses of cosmopolitanism, Christian ethics and their overlaps. My main research questions are:

- What are the similarities and differences in Church actors’ and faith-based organizations’ methods on the practices of raising awareness about the Israeli–Palestinian conflict?
- How are the ethics of cosmopolitanism significant and how do they influence development work?

In my work four thematic approaches can be recognized. Firstly, the ethics of the development work is a significant aspect. Secondly, I consider the networks and partners in their work, especially the EAPPI program and its participants. Thirdly, my focus is on the institutional perspective, which is centered on the necessity of global frameworks built around international law and justice to support universal human rights. Lastly, I analyze how the conflict is approached through economic aspects and how the Finnish and Swedish consumers are informed of their consumer choices to have impact on the Israeli–Palestinian conflict.
1.2 Relevance of the Subject

Finn Church Aid, the Church of Sweden and EAPPI are working with the common aim of peace building in the Middle East. The actors I have been studying are using different methods such as advocacy work, campaigning and political activism. Rather than concrete actions and political decisions between state and military actors I concentrate on globally held discourses, values and narratives that are related to ethical positions, practices of solidarity and consumer choices.

The church actors and faith-based organizations are seldom studied as agents of peace building development in Nordic countries, especially from comparative perspective. Nevertheless, they do have a long tradition of development and humanitarian work and have significant global networks. There are also differences in their institutional structures. The comparative perspective focusing on networks rather than on individual actors produces novel understanding and information of the dynamics of the conflict.

2 Background

Both the Church of Sweden and Finn Church Aid have taken a stance to work towards ending the occupation of Palestinian territories (Svenska Kyrkan Internationellt arbete, 2014, Kirkon Ulkomaanapu, 2014, EAPPI, 2014). This aspiration constructs the approaches and practices of their development work and conflict resolution in the context of the Israeli–Palestinian conflict. In concrete terms, I address the Israeli–Palestinian conflict from the perspectives of the EAPPI program and campaigns against Israeli goods produced in the occupied Palestinian territories. These cases are related to the existence of the illegal Israeli settlements, and it is important to create an understanding of what they are and what they mean for Palestinians.

2.1 The Israeli–Palestinian Conflict and the Illegal Israeli Settlements

It is out of the scope of this study to examine the complex history of the whole Israeli–Palestinian conflict. However, to be able to understand the contemporary situation, I shall briefly review the important events after the Six-Day War in 1967. For my research purposes, especially the history of Israeli settlements in Palestinian territory is relevant.

Israel’s victory in the Six-Day War meant geographical expansion of the conflict since Israel occupied the Golan Heights, the West Bank, Sinai and the Gaza Strip (Persson 2012, p. 271). By this victory, it achieved its strategic goal and by occupation attained borders to protect. At that time, there was no strong international opposition towards occupation. From the Israeli
viewpoint, the aim was to reach an agreement of the territories with Jordan and to exchange them back later to guarantee peace (Huuhtanen 2002, p. 52-53). Since the end of the 1960s, Israel has been exploiting the occupied territories and Israeli Jews that have moved to the West Bank have obtained a large proportion of the territory. The building of settlements begun after the war, there were 10 000 settlers in 1972 and now their number is estimated to be 500 000 (Vartiala, Pöyhönen and Purje 2012, p. 6, Foundation for Middle East Peace 2014).

In 1977, the right wing party Likud wanted to solve the problem of the occupied territories by keeping the Israeli governance and the security of the territories but granting autonomy to Palestinians (Huuhtanen 2002, p. 56). After the 1987 Intifada, Israeli political positions have become fragmented and there has no longer been a unified view on the foreign policy (Huuhtanen 2002, p. 60).

The exploitation of the occupation has lead to establishment of the settlements, which are Israeli communities, and are supported by an infrastructure, which includes checkpoints, special roads, and the separation barrier dividing them from the surrounding Palestinian population. The settlements violate the international law and the UN Security Council resolutions but this has been disregarded throughout the 45 years of Israel´s occupation of the Palestinian territory: every Israeli government has supported continued settlement expansion (Trading Away Peace 2012, p. 10).

Ariel Sharon’s (2001) infamous quote illustrates an extreme position towards settlements:

> Everybody has to move, run and grab as many hilltops as they can to enlarge the settlements, because everything we take now will stay ours. Everything we don’t grab will go to them.

(EAPPI Blog, 2014)

However, the history of the occupation (and settlements) has not been interpreted in an unified manner. After the Six-Day War the existing ambiguity has increased. The left-wing ideology of the Zionist movement supported the view of the occupied territories as a security question and saw the returning these territories to Palestinians as an opportunity to achieve peace. For Likud and other right-wing parties, these territories were ideologically important: they were a part of the historical territory of Israel and should not be given away (Huuhtanen 2002, p. 46).
Finn Church Aid and the Church of Sweden support the return of the 1967 borders, which is also internationally advocated solution for the conflict (Svenska Kyrkan Internationellt arbete, 2014 and Finn Church Aid, 2014). Furthermore, the stance that FCA and the Church of Sweden have taken through the EAPPI program and in the campaigns against Israeli produced goods in the occupied Palestinian territories are in line with the World Council of Churches’ (WCC)\(^1\) views (Ibid.).

2.2 The Ecumenical Accompaniment Programme (EAPPI) and Labeling the Origins Campaign

The Ecumenical Accompaniment Programme in Palestine and Israel (EAPPI), brings internationals to the West Bank to experience life under occupation. The initiative for the EAPPI program came from the Heads of Churches in Jerusalem during the second Intifada in 2001. In their Easter message it was claimed that the worldwide Christian community should take real action and not merely issue more statements of concern. In response, it presented ”the idea of providing a human chain that would become the eyes and the ears, the hands and the legs, of the world-wide church in Palestine” (EAPPI, 2014). 340 churches responded to this challenge and the EAPPI program was established in 2002. The program sends peace observers to Palestine and Israel with the purpose of reducing violence and promoting respect for international law. It is carried out in co-operation with the World Council of Churches together and approximately 20 countries are participating to it (EAPPI, 2014).

Practices of faith-based organizations (FBO) arise from official declarations of official church initiatives but they can also result from stance taken by non-governmental organizations (NGO). Effective action can result from both hierarchical and grassroots schemes. For example, the Finnish and Swedish Labeling the Origins-campaigns have their routes in the Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions (BDS) movement. It was launched in 2005 by Palestinian non-governmental organizations and religious communities. The BDS movement encourages

---

\(^1\) The World Council of Churches is a community of churches. In the end of 2012, it had 345 member churches. The majority of the WCC’s founding churches were European and North American but today most member churches are in Africa, Asia, the Caribbean, Latin America, the Middle East and the Pacific. The WCC brings together churches, religious groups and church fellowships in more than 110 countries and territories throughout the world, representing over 500 million Christians and including most of the world's Orthodox churches, scores of Anglican, Baptist, Lutheran, Methodist and Reformed churches, as well as many United and Independent churches (World Council of Churches, 2014).
to boycott Israeli products and to avoid investments to Israel. The idea of influencing the state of Israel this way is similar to what was used in South Africa to bring down apartheid regime. The BDS movement has become a global effort, and many corporations have changed their conduct as the result of the campaign. In Israel there has been a strong reaction towards the campaign, and in July 2012 the controversial law, which states that encouraging boycotting Israel will lead to prosecution and financial claims, was adopted (Vartiala, Pöyhönen and Purje 2012, p. 15).

The BDS campaign has not been applied in a standardized manner, and some of the participating organizations and actors are encouraging to boycott only Israeli goods produced in the occupied territories. The World Council of Churches (WCC) has adopted this approach and both Church of Sweden and Finn Church Aid are supporting this stance (Ibid.).

The BDS movement presents an important strategy to demonstrate international solidarity and is particularly significant in the current context of a revival of peace-building initiatives in the Middle East, and Israel-Palestine in particular (Bakan and Abu-Laban 2009, p. 32).

2.3 The Church of Sweden and Finn Church Aid

It is important to focus to the organizational differences of the Church of Sweden and Finn Church Aid to be able to understand similarities and differences in their positions in society. The two actors have organizational differences since in Finland the Evangelical Lutheran Church is still a state church while in Sweden this position was terminated in 2000. Additionally, there have been changes in organizing the Church of Sweden’s international and development work since Lutherhjälpen and Svenska kyrkans mission (SKM) missionary organizations were became a part of Church of Sweden’s international work in 2008.

Finn Church Aid (FCA) it is a faith-based organization (FBO) and has more than 60 years of experience in aid work. It is an independent non-profit organization and it performs development cooperation, humanitarian assistance and advocacy work on behalf of the Evangelical Lutheran Church in Finland. FCA has a staff of 180 people, located both in Finland and in the countries with its programs. The organization is financed by private donations from the public, funds from Evangelical Lutheran parishes, Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland\(^2\), UN, EU, ECHO and other bilateral donors. The foundation of private

\(^2\) FCA is one of the 16 partnership organizations for development cooperation of the Ministry for Foreign Affairs of Finland.
fundraising is from the regular donors. Its annual budget is roughly 26 million Euros (Kirkon ulkomaanapu, 2014).

The Swedish church has a long tradition of development work: the church’s missionary organization was established already in 1874. After the Second World War in 1947 Lutherhjälpen was established and its main purpose has been to concentrate to provide aid to war-ruined Europe. Church of Sweden has been present in the Middle East since Lutherhjälpen was established in 1947. However, in pace of time also Lutherhjälpen started to engage in development and humanitarian work outside of Europe and these two organizations were basically working in the same area under two different names. For this reason Lutherhjälpen and Svenska kyrkans mission (SKM) missionary organizations were joined to be a part of Church of Sweden’s international work in 2008. (Svenska Kyrkan Internationellt arbete, 2014) Church of Sweden is also member of the Christian Council of Sweden, which has 26 member churches. Additionally, the SEAPPI program is administered through the Christian Council of Sweden (The Christian Council of Sweden, 2014).

Both Church of Sweden and FCA have extended partner networks and international cooperation. For example, they are part of the World Council of Churches (World Council of Churches, 2014). The other significant and large community for both actors is the ACT Alliance, a network of church-related development organizations, which is one of the largest aid agency networks in the world (ACT Alliance, 2014). Both are also members of Humanitarian Accountability Partnership (HAP).

In order to fully capture the ethical basis of the faith-based development work and peace building efforts, I will next examine the role Christianity has in literature related to my research.

3 Previous Research on Christian Ethics and Approaches to Humanitarian Aid and Development Work

There is a wide and varied range of literature about Christianity, development work and humanitarian aid. In the literature of Christian values and ethics, I concentrate on authors who discuss values, discourses and narratives and elaborate their role in the work of faith-based organizations (FBOs) and religious non-governmental organizations (RNGOs). Additionally,

---

3 The Swedish part of EAPPI program is called SEAPPI.
4 HAP International is the humanitarian sector's first international self-regulatory body. Members of HAP are committed to meeting the highest standards of accountability and quality management.
Luke Bretherton (2006) introduces the concept of Christian cosmopolitanism, which gives a relevant emphasis in the context of this study since my aim is to explore the relationship between cosmopolitan ethics and the Christian aid work organizations. There is plenty of literature dealing with either cosmopolitanism or Christian values but their overlaps and entanglements are relatively understudied.

Christian actors in aid work differ from other actors because of the distinct values behind their work. To understand the meaning of religion it is essential to summarize its core ideas and values to assess their significance in the aid work. Religious identity and belief act often as “a motivation for charity and altruism” (Flanigan 2009, p. 3). Moreover, following J. Bruce Nichols, Flanigan summarizes the common idea and history of Christian solidarity: “it was religious motivation that inspired relief workers to travel halfway around the world and serve their fellow human beings” (p. 4). Bretherton (2006) defines Christian cosmopolitan tradition in the context of wider philosophical debate on what the duty of care is in the case of refugees. He defines it as “the theology of personhood and the practice of prayer in order to present a series of responses to the situation of refugees in the contemporary context” (p. 39-40). Furthermore, he points out that duty “is not teleologically ordered to the love of humanity, but is subsumed within it: that is, love for humanity precedes and has priority over love of one's immediate neighbor. In short, pietas for humanity is understood as overriding the respect that is owed to one's particular community or to God“ (p. 46-47). This definition clearly emphasizes the universal dimension of human rights.

Moreover, Christianity and religion as motivators to aid work represent a discourse, which is rather bound to a commitment that correlates with the “story-shaped faith” (Reid 2008, p. 128). It can be explained as that “at its heart, Christianity, when practiced, is a story-shaped faith and adherents choose to live in a commitment to the notion that life matters and has meaning because this story-shaped view of reality is controlled by telos implicit in Christian narrative” (Ibid). In addition, according to the Christian worldview, people are seen in this story as participating together, for them being Christian means that an individual has decided that even if it seems sometimes strange, there is reason for hope (Ibid.). It can be argued that the aid workers are reliving the Christian narrative in their work.

Some biblical narratives are especially important. For example, to relate the Christian ethics to the aid work, the story of the Good Samaritan becomes educational because it is often recited as “justifying a universalistic ethic of unconditional love” (Bretherton 2006, p. 57). According to it, aid does not have restrictions; everyone should be counted as neighbors. The
importance of the locality and closeness is relevant in the Good Samaritan’s actions: his responsibility and loyalty are not to some generalized 'Other' that exists nowhere and everywhere. Furthermore, the story outlines how the one in need is portrayed as a fleshly body and to pass by without encountering her/his distress is a sin (Ibid.). It is noteworthy how the discourse here focuses on sin, which is absent from the human rights discourses.

The benefits of the FBOs and RNGOs as development agents are significant. Jarle Simensen (2006) asserts how the missions and their partners, the local churches and religious NGOs, present an interesting alternative to the conventional strategy of the governmental aid system; both on the donor and the recipient side. According to Simensen, their main strategy is related to religious change, based on the primary aim of conversion. In practical work, this implies stressing the attitudes, character building and public and personal morality (p. 100-101).

Simensen also points out the crucial role of religion and reminds that in Africa, where the religious worldview often has a pronounced role for peoples’ existence, the local churches represent the most longstanding organizations of the country. Additionally, compared to other NGOs, missionary societies typically finance a larger part of the aid effort out of their own money (Ibid. p. 93-97). However, in my case the role of Christianity is much more complex and vague. People participating in programs have different ethical aspirations and some saw Christian characteristics as less relevant. Therefore, the more traditional ideas of conversion are non-existent in this context.

However, there is reservation towards the faith as a motivator, and the critique towards FBOs and RNGOs is relevant. The historical perspective is important since Christianity has not always been accepting and caring: the history of violence is evident and persisting and should not be overlooked. Furthermore, the risk of evangelical coercion exists and the power relations affect the way aid is provided. It is also important to acknowledge that religious organizations are not merely driven by altruism; there is also an aspiration to gain more followers. Besides, in many cases the poor do not have a real choice whether to seek services that FBOs provide or go without. This can lead to a situation where the local customs and religions are not really accepted and respected because of the unequal power relation created by the aid providers (Flanigan 2009, p. 4-8).

Another important topic is the role of religious aid workers and how they are seen to be motivated by faith. This aspect is discussed in diverse and analytical manner, and the meaning of faith is also problematized: in several studies (Flanigan 2009, Simensen 2006) it is argued that the aspiration to gain more followers is an important fact and should not be overlooked.
However, the context plays a major role. The FBOs and RNGOs in the Nordic countries might differ significantly from the ones in the U.S. and the aid work might follow different principles in Africa, Latin America and the Middle East. It is also noteworthy is that there is lack of case and comparative studies of the role of religion in Nordic faith-based organizations. For example, Simensen’s article *Religious NGOs and the Politics of International Aid: The Norwegian Experience* (2006) is a case study and this way brings together many distinctive characteristics of aid work and reflects the historical aspects of the religious values. However, the role of religion in aid work is not interpreted in homogeneous ways, and should be studied more. Into what extent are values built around Christian ethics, or is the combination of Christianity and cosmopolitanism relevant in the way Bretherton is suggesting? Careful study of discourses, narratives and values sheds light on these aspects.

4 Methodology

My study concentrates on how wide assortment of practices and representations are related to discourses of peace building and development and are applied by different actors. As case studies I will focus on the principles of the EAPPI program, which seeks to provide up-to-date, reliable information on the occupation, and Labeling the Origins campaigns, which target Israeli goods produced in the occupied Palestinian territories (oPt). I focus on documents, media representations and descriptions of personal experiences to study and compare how discourses are constructed and reproduced, what are the most significant narratives guiding the practices and how are the values in the work related to normative frameworks?

4.1. Discourse and Narrative Analysis

Discourse analysis forms a crucial part of my methodological approach. I follow Howarth’s definition of discourse, according to which “the social meaning of words, speeches, actions and institutions are all understood in relation to the overall context of which they form a part” (Howarth 1995, p. 119). Furthermore, a discourse cannot be ‘non-social’ or ‘non-cultural’ or ‘non-historical’ (Blommaert 2005, p. 19). In other words, our environment is transformed by discourse into culturally and socially meaningful one (Ibid.). In addition, power relations are significant in discourses: historically they are contingent and politically constructed. Through construction of friends and enemies discourses acquire their identity (Howarth 1995, p.121). This power relation can be seen in the context of the Palestinians fighting to regain land in the West Bank and whether they are described as “freedom fighters” or as “terrorists” (Hall 1996,
p. 203). The fact is that they are fighting but what does it mean? If we believe that they are terrorists and act upon this belief/knowledge they become terrorists because we treat them as such. The language [discourse] has real effects in practice (Ibid.).

Methodologically, I use narratives to complement discursive analysis. Narratives tie actions into storylines that can be applied as models in other contexts (Robertson 2005, p. 228-230). In order to analyze semiotic and narrative constructs as meaningful aspect of development work, I will discuss how the Christian and cosmopolitan values are present and affecting the work and its methods. Particularly, the language of aid is paid attention to: What kind of discourse is represented in relation to faith against the wider background? In what context universal values are referred to? How is peace conceptualized in the discourses of faith-based organizations?

4.2 Comparative Study and Normative Framework

A comparative study is applied to explain similarities and differences between various significant actors (Landman 2008, p. 4). Methodologically, exceptionality can only be established through comparative study (Mackie and Marsh 1995, p. 175). The method illustrates and emphasizes the distinctive characteristics of development work and how they are applied to different contexts. The comparison of different cases enables one to analyze the empirical material comprehensively and to relate it to appropriate theoretical framework. Furthermore, “comparison provides a basis for making statements about empirical regularities and for evaluating and interpreting cases relative to substantive and theoretical criteria” (Ragin 1987, p.1). Moreover, it creates an understanding of the unique characters of both cases and produces new knowledge of the similarities and differences of the relevant factors.

Initially, it is necessary to establish the contextual description to be able to do systematic research (Landman 2008, p. 5). In my case, the Israeli–Palestinian conflict is the key factor. It is essential to include the discursive background since it describes the traditions, approaches and values as motivators for this work. The conceptual classification in this study is done to assemble events, programs and approaches into distinct categories, and to create identifiable and shared characteristics (Landman 2008, p. 5-6). The EAPPI program is interesting case in this respect. It is important to compare the approaches of different but networked actors towards peace building, conflict resolution, advocacy work and the international cooperation. It is also important to compare the nature of the advocacy work in different locations, in my case, Finland and Sweden. In the course of my study I will establish comparative frameworks
on differently structured ethical positions, institutional arrangements and economic aspects of the campaigns.

Many of the issues I study, are closely related to “the discovery or application of moral notions in the sphere of political relations” (Berlin in Glaser 1995, p. 21). Universal ethics and values can only be understood as encounter “abstract moral reasoning but also in more detailed discussion of institutions and policies” (Ibid.). Together they form normative frameworks with wide implications the life of the actors. The normative approach provides foundation for understanding several, often contradictory, discourses in my field.

4.3 Material

The material used in this study reflects multiple ways the actors their message. The language of aid, values of solidarity and approaches to religious texts have been of importance. The material consists of variety of texts and documents provided by organizations: case-studies, websites, campaign materials, blog entries, articles, statistics, and surveys. I have also conducted four interviews to support, criticize and elaborate the official materials. Moreover, the material elaborates how the Israeli–Palestinian conflict is approached from various angles and what are the significant elements in this work. For example, the importance of the international law and EU-legislation, and the illegality of the Israeli occupation are the essential aspects. The statements of the actors I study are in many cases building upon these discourses. On the other hand, these discourses are challenged by others emphasizing suffering and other human dimensions.

4.3.1 Interviews

The four semi-structured interviews provide qualitative data and are used in order to create deeper understanding of the work these actors are performing in the conflict area.

Interviews provide additional information of the everyday conditions in the conflict zone and complement the study with descriptions of personal experiences. Methodologically, I follow Charles Briggs’ position of interview as interpretation which is jointly produced by the interviewer and the respondent rather than reflection of what is ‘out there’ (1986, p. 3). In interviewing to locate significant contexts. Briggs argues that “communication is punctuated with ‘contextualization cues’, that mark relevant features of the social and linguistic setting” (1986, p. 72). These are the distinctions that I have identified in my work.
The interviews were conducted with three EAPPI participants: two of them were from Sweden: Ragnar Svenserud and Anders Forsberg, and one from Finland, Elina Mäkilä. They all had been in the conflict area during 2013-2014. Additionally, I interviewed Sabina Bergholm from FCA, who is managing the EAPPI program and Label the Origins-campaign in Finland. The interviews were done in Swedish and Finnish via Skype and the translations are my own. I have edited some of the language to increase readability. The original quotes are added as footnotes and the basic structure of interview (most relevant questions) can be found in appendix 1. The interviewees were selected to represent different viewpoints of the work because of their backgrounds and positions vis-à-vis church organizations. Due to the scope and time frame of this study I chose to concentrate on the EAPPI program participants because they can provide first hand data of the conflict zone and how the advocacy work is carried out in Finland and in Sweden. In relation to Labeling the Origins campaigns my material is based on campaign documents with some clarifications from Bergholm but with less focus on personal experience.

4.3.2 Reports

There is abundance of written material on the subject the correctly labeling Israeli products from illegal settlements, on how the situation can be influenced in the EU, national level and individual consumers. These reports illustrate how the work is carried out in practice and there are also recommendations for measures that should and could be taken. The report Trading Away Peace: How Europe helps sustain illegal Israeli settlements (2012) is produced in cooperation between several actors: churches and NGOs including Church of Sweden and Finn Church Aid. It summarizes the approach that is present in the Labeling the Origins campaigns in a following way:

Recommended measures for European governments and the EU: to ensure their policies do not directly or indirectly support entrenchment and expansion of settlements. Both national governments and the EU have a number of feasible measures at their disposal. These measures target only illegal settlements, not Israel.

(p. 30)

Finn Church Aid’s Labeling the Origins campaign (Alkuperä merkkaa - kampanja) follows similar discourse and the report Forbidden Fruits – The Connections of Companies Operating in Finland to the Illegal Settlements in Israel\(^5\) (Kielletyt hedelmät - Suomessa toimivien

\(^5\) My translation.
yritysten yhteydet Israeliin laittomiin siirtokuntiin), which FCA had subscribed from Finnwatch⁶ and was published in March 2012, is based on the facts of the situation and production taking place in illegal Israeli settlements. It suggests reaching out towards corporate responsibility and consumer activity. Moreover, there are already results of the FCA campaign expressed in a follow-up report Finnwatch made in March 2013⁷. This material demonstrates the effects of the method FCA has used in this case and its in Finland.

In Sweden the campaign was launched in 2013. There where two reports⁸ published in 2008 and 2010 by Swedwatch, whom Church of Sweden is cooperating with, but the campaign became active later and is using Trading Away Peace report as guideline.

4.3.3 Theological Documents

The theological perspectives and critical issues in international development work of FBOs I study are heavily influenced by theological documents. Christian Aid (CA) report Theology and international development (2010) and The Association of World Council of Churches related Development Organizations in Europe’s (APRODEV) Religion & Development - A Discussion Paper (2012) have been valuable sources of information in my work. FCA, Church of Sweden and CA are members of APRODEV so I consider these documents to be a good basis for ethical discussion. These materials were recommended to me by Minna Hietamäki, research doctor in the Academy of Finland Center of Excellence, Reason and Religious Recognition and has studied these issues. The CA report explores “theological responses from churches, ecumenical groups and partners in the global South, and offer their further perspectives on working with other faith groups” (p. 2). I consider the report relevant and significant material since CA is also participating in the EAPPI program and is a member of ACT Alliance⁹ like the Church of Sweden and FCA. Additionally, the report and its theological discussion is a good indicator of the role and meaning of the work of faith-based organizations (FBO) and religious non-governmental organizations (RNGO), and how Christian values are present in their work. The FBOs and RNGOs are discussed from the theoretical perspectives in order to widen the analysis of the Christian values that are present in the discourses and narratives of the work of Church of Sweden and Finn Church Aid.

---

⁶Finnwatch is Finnish civil society organizations focusing on corporate responsibility in Global South.
⁹ACT Alliance is a network of church-related development organizations and has of more than 140 churches and partner organizations working together in over 140 countries.
Additionally, I have used the Church of Sweden’s leaflet *Together for a Just World - the Church of Sweden’s International Work* (2013), which outlines the main themes of the work.

### 4.3.4 Internet and Other Media

The websites of Church of Sweden, Finn Church Aid and the EAPPI, representing 20 countries have been important sources of information. These sites provide extensive coverage of the structures of organizations, background information, the information of partners in development work, current campaigns and links to other relevant sources. The language of aid and the Christian values are additionally present in these websites and they contribute to analysis of Christianity as a semiotic and narrative construct.

Many of the EAPPIs have written several articles and blog entries of their time in the occupied territories. This material has been a valuable source of information for it describes how the participants experience the work methods in conflict area and what it means to live in the occupied territories. There is a disclaimer in the blogs stating that the views of the writers do not necessarily represent the view of the sending organization. This is an interesting aspect and contributes to the analysis of the methods of these actors and their stances towards the Israeli–Palestinian conflict.

### 5 Theoretical Framework

The theoretical framework of this study consists of various cosmopolitan theories that I apply to analyze the narratives and ideological aspects of the faith-based organization’s methods. The ethical aspects are presented from different perspectives to create an understanding of the diversity of how cosmopolitanism can be comprehended and additionally applied to the ethical discussion. Moreover, the cosmopolitan ethics and approaches towards aid work are introduced so that their parallels and contradictions in the field of ethics can be analyzed later in the study. Here, I lay foundation for the use of approaches, which will be expanded and considered critically in the analysis chapter (6).

#### 5.1 Distinctive Definitions of Cosmopolitanism

The idea of cosmopolitanism has been understood differently throughout the history. Traditionally a cosmopolitan is described as an intellectual, who is not bound in the local culture of his upbringing, and in gender terms cosmopolitans are usually seen as men. They are mobile persons, who are eager to move, to change and to invent. The capacity to empathy and to see oneself in other fellow’s situation is also considered as crucial (van der Veer 2002,
However, cosmopolitan openness to understanding accompanied with a desire to bring progress and improvement can lead to cosmopolitanism with a questionable moral mission: “there is the desire of the morality of the modern nation-state, the cosmopolitanism of the colonial empire” (Ibid. p. 167).

Stuart Hall (2002), on the other hand, expands the understanding of cosmopolitanism and points out how for many people cultural repertoires have become enriched and altered. He argues that the culture *per se* is not absent but in fact people “are drawing on the traces and residues of many cultural systems, of many ethical systems – and that is precisely what cosmopolitanism means” (p. 26). He elaborates this by stating that cosmopolitanism represents the capability “to stand outside of having one’s life written and scripted by any one community, whether that is a faith or tradition or religion or culture and to draw selectively on a variety of discursive meanings” (Ibid.).

The idea of cosmopolitanism has developed during the years and the aspect of elitism has been criticized in many of the more recent definitions. This is also an important aspect in order to create an understanding of the meaning of the cosmopolitan ethics identified in other contexts. Arjun Appadurai (2011) introduces a very different, anthropological perspective to cosmopolitanism, challenges its association with the privilege, and forms his theory around the idea of “cosmopolitanism from below” (p. 32). According to it cosmopolitanism as “the urge to expand one’s current horizons of self and cultural identity and wish to connect with a wider world in the name of values which in principle could belong to anyone and apply in any circumstances” (Ibid.) can be extended to marginalized communities organized around different, but distinctively cosmopolitan ideas.

### 5.2 Cosmopolitan Ethical Aspects

Different perspectives of cosmopolitanism contribute to creation of an understanding of diverse ethical aspects, which form the values and discourses of the aid and development. Samuel Scheffler (1999) presents ‘cosmopolitanism as a doctrine of justice’ and elaborates that it opposes any position, which principally advocates that the norms of justice apply first and foremost within bounded groups including some subdivision of the global population (in Caine 2010 p. 154).

In the same tradition of thought, Martha Nussbaum (2003) defines a cosmopolitan as a “person whose allegiance is to the worldwide community of human beings” (p. 4). She uses the stoics’ definition of *kosmou polites*, citizens of the world, which regards all human beings
as fellow citizens and the recognition of humanity as the beginning of this allegiance. She strives after an international community that realizes shared human values and, moreover, acts upon them (p. 5-7). Kwame Anthony Appiah (2007) develops this idea further by claiming that cosmopolitans believe in universal truth and that the central idea is that every human being has obligations to each other and that everybody matters (p. 144). Mary Kaldor (2002) shares this view and suggests that an individual should be prepared to risk her/his life for the humanity but not an unlimited way because she/he is a part of humanity. She points out that there already are human rights activists and aid workers who risk their lives for humanity (p. 278). The theme of participation promotes cosmopolitan ethics and illustrates how they are easily transformed into practices.

The universal dimension of cosmopolitanism is often emphasized in moral discourses. Andrew Kuper (2002) advocates for a school of moral thought that brings up another interesting aspects of cosmopolitanism. According to him, in cosmopolitan morality, interests of all persons must count equally in moral reflection: geographical location or citizenship cannot make fundamental difference to the rights and responsibilities of individuals (p. 108). Furthermore, he perceives that it is significant to consider the question “Who must do what for whom?” and how this is a conceptual and political challenge (2005, p. x).

The interpretation of cosmopolitanism that David Held (2003) introduces is essential in the context of this study since he claims that “cosmopolitan principles are not principles for some remote utopia; for they are at the centre of significant post Second World War legal and political developments, from the 1948 UN declaration of Human Rights to the 1998 adaptation of the statue of the International Criminal Court” (p. 200). Furthermore, many of these developments took place because of the terrible events of Nazism, fascism and the Holocaust (Ibid.).

Cosmopolitan ethos provides interesting perspective for the study of conflicts. In this study, I shall discuss the discourses and approaches focusing especially on peace building on the Israeli–Palestinian conflict. The ethical perspectives on the matter will be addressed mainly by Nussbaum’s, Appiah’s and Kuper’s arguments since they provide a basis to cosmopolitan morality and the ideas of responsibilities. These perspectives and arguments elaborate whether the cosmopolitan values can be seen as an essential part of the aid work, particularly in this context. Furthermore, I will consider how these values are transformed into practices. The narratives of injustice and justice are additionally crucial themes and will be reflected on different grounds. The centrality of human rights will be discussed throughout the study since
the work of Finn Church Aid, Church of Sweden and EAPPI are all based on them to a large extent. I focus on the uses and practices associated with human rights discourse. It is out of the scope of this study to problematize the formation of these principles, such as the 1948 UN declaration of Human Rights.

5.3 Rights, Responsibilities and Law in Institutional Framework

The institutional perspective of cosmopolitanism creates an understanding into what extent values are acknowledged in global administrative structures. The demands of the increasingly globalized world have made many scholars acknowledge the need to go beyond the dominance of national frameworks to find new ways of thinking about the mutual responsibilities that necessarily arise with the change of paradigm. Caine (2010) elaborates this tendency: “Many of those wishing to criticize the exclusionary assumptions of nationalism and patriotism see useful starting points for contemporary discussion in classical ideas of ‘world citizenship’ and in Kant’s conception of cosmopolitanism as a form of world politics in which moral norms of respect for all humanity work to contain aggression and to promote mutual solidarity” (p. 153).

The discussion is expanded by David Held (2005) who emphasizes that the “illegitimate and unacceptable structures of power and vital need, has to be reconnected to cosmopolitan institution building” (p. 197). Moreover, he understands “cosmopolitanism ultimately to connote the ethical and political space that sets out the terms of reference for the recognition of people’s equal moral worth, their active agency, and what is required for autonomy and development” (p. 194). Furthermore, the story of globalization is not only economic - it is also about growing aspirations for international law and justice. This aspiration is present in the existence of the UN and the EU; in the changes to the laws of war to protect human rights, and in the emergence of international environmental regimes and the establishment of the International Criminal Court. He summarizes his position: “there is also another narrative to being told – a narrative that seeks to reframe human activity and entrench it in law, rights and responsibilities” (Held 2003, p. 185).

Discourse of cosmopolitanism is also a discourse of boundaries and exclusion. Mary Kaldor (2002) argues that cosmopolitan politics strive for inclusion instead of exclusion, and stand for multi-layered authority: local, regional, national and global (p. 276-277). Furthermore, she advocates for the need for global frameworks that would support universal human rights. This aspect would be included in what she defines as global social contract, aiming to provide a
way of living consistent with human dignity, so people do not have to commit crimes nor live off humanitarian aid. She points out that there are preconditions for positive change: the elements of global civil society need to exist (including political parties, NGOs, churches etc.), and for example sees the founding of the UN as a defining moment. However, she argues, that even if the human rights are acknowledged, the national and global institutions are inadequately defending them (p. 278). Scholars approach these issues from different perspectives. On the one hand, Jürgen Habermas (2011) argues that “the universalistic meaning of human rights reminds us of the need to develop a constitutional frame for an emerging multicultural world society” (p. 28). On the other hand, Ulrich Beck advocates for “a sense of a globally shared collective future”, which arises from the emerging awareness of common risks such as climate change and leads to an understanding of mutual global responsibility (in Vertovec and Cohen 2002, p.1).

My position is influenced by both Habermas and Beck. I consider the significant actors operating in networked manner creating new institutions and transforming the existing ones through campaigns and programs. Simultaneously, the emerging awareness of human rights and global frameworks that support justice and promote the idea of human dignity are influenced by Beck’s argument.

Through the institutional approach I shall discuss the cosmopolitan ethics from another point of view and, the aspect of responsibility will be emphasized. Some of the actors are influential in both ways: for example, the existence of the UN is seen as a reflection of cosmopolitan values and as an important actor realizing the universal human rights. The crucial questions are: What kind of foundation does the declaration of human rights provide for peace building efforts? What are the demands towards international community? How is the idea of mutual responsibilities addressed? How are the abstract values intertwined with actual practices on the ground?

5.4 The Actors of Justice

The ethical principles of cosmopolitanism are applied by various actors in changing real-life contexts. Onora O’Neill (2005) presents the idea of non-state actors as agents of justice and discusses how international non-governmental organizations (INGOs), transnational corporations (TNCs) and multinational corporations (MNCs) can advocate positive change, especially in weak states (p. 47). This aspect is essential since it illustrates how the campaigns against Israeli produced goods in the illegal settlements have changed the behavior of
corporations, especially stores selling these products. Furthermore, these aspects are closely connected with consumer responsibility, which is essential part of the campaigns. Bryant Simon (2011) points out how the very idea of connection between consumerism and politics can transform the world in significant ways: “as a first step in the process of politicalization, consumers have to think about, and recognize, the connection between what they buy and the related worlds of production, labor, and exchange. They need, in other words, to break the illusion of isolation and individual free choice that much of the consumer culture tries to build up around products in the first place” (p. 163). For this reason raising awareness of the consumers is essential part of the campaigns. The consumers are the true agents of transformation.

The famous peace and conflict researcher Johan Galtung (1969) is not usually described as a scholar of cosmopolitanism but his conceptual framework complements this study since it offers analytical tools to comprehend and analyze the methods that the actors are using. Structural violence, defined as a systematic ways for the regimes to prevent individuals to achieve their full potential, is a useful concept to understand conflict areas (p. 171), in my case the Israeli–Palestinian conflict. Moreover, the concepts of positive and negative peace, truly equal and free society and one where both personal and structural violence as well as a threat of violence are present (Ibid. p.183) is important to include in analysis.

6 Analysis

I build my analysis upon the framework I established while discussing my research questions. Firstly, the ethics of the development work are discussed in a more general manner; how are these actors formulating and negotiating the ethical basis for their work? Moreover, I concentrate on what is seen as the fundamental approach to responsibility towards other human beings. Secondly, the EAPPI program is considered from multiple viewpoints, based on encounters of different actors in different contexts. Thirdly, I elaborate the problems of the institutional approach, which is centered on the need for global frameworks built around international law and justice to support universal human rights. Fourthly, I focus on how the conflict is approached through economic aspects, namely how consumers are advised not to purchase Israeli goods produced in the occupied Palestinian territories (oPt).

6.1 Ethics of Development Work

Do the cosmopolitan ethics differ from the language of aid that the faith-based Christian organizations are advocating? The Christian church is a distinct figure and the values it
represents are commonly held in many parts of the world. Therefore the concepts of positive
and negative peace are important to include in the analysis, (Galtung 1969, p. 171) for they
point to situations where the church has moral obligation to intervene. These are also the
values the faith-based organizations (FBO) spread to its supporters and followers and to the
area where the aid is provided. For example, in Finn Church Aid (FCA) this message is
formed in a following way:

Our task is to reduce, together with less privileged people, their vulnerability and to work
towards a more just world. We aim at acquiring influence with those who are marginalized
and whose voices are not heard.

(Finn Church Aid, 2014)

To strive after and work towards more just world and diminish exclusion is additionally a
fundamental aspect in the ideas of cosmopolitan moral principles (Appiah 2007, Kuper 2002,
Nussbaum 2003). Furthermore, it is noteworthy to observe that the discourse, which FCA is
using, does not include a religious message. This aspect is relevant: even though FCA is a
faith-based organization it is also an independent development actor (Finn Church Aid, 2014).
Moreover, to argue the cause in this manner, the discourse is reaching out towards support
from individuals who recognize cosmopolitan values, have capacity to empathy and to see
oneself in other fellow’s situation (van der Veer 2002, p. 166-167). The message emphasizes
also marginality. In the context of the Israeli–Palestinian conflict, FCA’s approach is formed
on the basis of recognizing the need for aid but refers also to the structural violence in the
area:

Those in the most vulnerable situation in the Occupied Palestinian Territories need aid
from the outside world. However, relief and development aid alone do not provide a
sustainable solution to the increasing poverty and insecurity in the area.

(The Invisibles Campaign of Finn Church Aid 2009, p. 6-7)

The connection with cosmopolitan values is apparent here; especially since the stance taken
by FCA advocates that the international community’s role should be more active in solving
the conflict. Furthermore, this illustrates that the language of aid is not language of sacrifice,
rather addressing sustainability and structural problems. It should be understood as an
argument for the need of change and acknowledgement that the interests of the globally
disadvantaged must be included in the discourse of social and economic cooperation (Kuper
Many of these same principles can be found in the Church of Sweden’s international works’ core values:

Humanity has a unique position and responsibility to ensure that life is not harmed. This is why we work towards sustainable development, where people take responsibility for the impact of their lifestyle on climate change and the environment. The struggles for peace, justice and a sustainable environment are interlinked. Our vision is to live the Kingdom of God, a creation made whole and a unified humanity living in justice, freedom and peace. (Together for a Just World 2013, p. 4)

The idea that everybody matters is fundamental (Appiah 2007, Nussbaum, 2003). To raise awareness of how people’s lifestyles are interlinked with the struggles for peace, justice and a sustainable environment brings upon the idea of our globally shared collective future and that we are all part of shaping it (Beck in Vertovec and Cohen 2002, p.1). The mission for development work is seen to be centered on “as an active part of the worldwide church, God calls us to being life by sending us to share the good news, defend human dignity, care for creation and in love live out our faith in Jesus Christ both in word and deed” (Together for a Just World, 2013). The normative framework of the Church of Sweden relies heavily on biblical discourses but combines it with contemporary reflections on environmental problems. How does biblical discourse affect their work?

I argue, that the references to religious norms, narratives and discourses are to a large degree, similar to the cosmopolitan ideas of responsibility. The references to Bible construct an image of an empathetic human being, which is parallel to the idea of a cosmopolitan who is a “person whose allegiance is to the worldwide community of human beings” (Nussbaum 2003, p. 4). Moreover, in the discussion of moral values and peace building, the distinction between the two strands of the notion of cosmopolitanism, moral and cultural, contributes to the understanding and formulation of the international aid work (Appiah 2007). The moral dimension addresses the obligations to others, which is perceived as a fundamental value in the work of the organizations I have studied. These obligations extend beyond those related to us by citizenships or by kith and kind (Appiah 2007, p. xiii). The other crucial aspect is the importance of cultural context and “that we take seriously the value not just of human life but of particular human lives, which means taking an interest in the practices and beliefs that lend them significance” (Ibid.). Both Christian and cosmopolitan approaches embrace the notion of universality but are challenged by notions of cultural particularity.
The equality of all men and women is an important notion in the faith-based development work. The Biblical narratives and discourses are referred to and representative of the values. However, the cosmopolitan moral principles are actualized in this work with an emphasis that interests of all persons must count equally in moral deliberation. In addition, the rights and responsibilities of the individuals are not defined by geographical location or citizenship (Kuper 2002, p. 108). This view of equality is embraced by The Association of World Council of Churches related Development Organizations in Europe (APRODEV), an organization which both the Church of Sweden and FCA are members of:

APRODEV agencies believe that all human beings are children of God, irrespective of achievements and abilities, ethnicity, religion, gender and social reputation. The belief that all human beings are created in the image of God supersedes all differences that may exist. (Religion & Development 2012, p. 19)

This principle of equality is elaborated by Nussbaum (2003), who argues that being born Swedish, Finnish, Israeli, Palestinian, rich or poor is an accident of birth, and furthermore, is “morally irrelevant” when people are counted as equal worth (p. 133). It can be concluded that even though theological references do not play a major role in FCA’s communication their ethical aspects of the development work are constructed in similar ways – the themes of equality, humanity, responsibility and solidarity are represented in the discourses they use. The combination of both discourses, the cosmopolitan and the Christian, is elaborated in the following way:

The relationships between God and human beings and between people are central to the Christian faith and we believe that the major issues of development […] can be formulated in terms of broken relationships between rich and poor, women and men, people and the environment, and so on. […] Thus our work as Christian development agencies is based on exposing where that brokenness lies, and in demonstrating by all the means available how those relationships may be healed. (Religion & Development 2012, p. 12)

This illustrates the definition of a faith-based organization: how it can base its discourses on either universal or Christian values. The discourse of brokenness as associated with gender equality, environmental problems, etc. refers to the Christian values and biblical narratives. Furthermore, the discourse addresses the positive change in near future. Christian discourse is flexible; it does not need to refer to the abstract values and classifications. In other words,
Paula Clifford, who has written the Christian Aid report *Theology and International Development* (2010), summarizes the position:

> At the most elementary level, the work of a Christian development agency in this context is twofold: to show people just who their neighbor is, and to advocate an appropriate response to that neighbor’s needs.

(p. 30)

6.2 EAPPI

The Ecumenical Accompaniment Programme in Palestine and Israel (EAPPI) is an international observer program run by the World Council of Churches (WCC) and it is based on principles of international humanitarian and human-rights law, including resolutions of the UN Security Council, General Assembly and Commission on Human Rights (EAPPI, 2014). Since the beginning of the program, August 2002, there have been 279 Swedish participants, 35 have taken part more than once. In a yearly basis, there have been around 23 participants per year, this number has depended on the financing of the program. Between April 2013 and April 2014 there were 20 participants (SEAPPI, 2014). Finland has participated in the program since 2005, and in recent years there have been approximately 12 participants every year (Bergholm, May 8, 2014). Internationally, there are 15 countries that are sending participants.

The work in Palestine is conducted in small groups, which consist of people from different countries. One of the goals is to recruit different kinds of people; for example, in Elina Mäkilä’s group there was a social worker, a nurse and a student of Middle Eastern studies who spoke fluent Arabic. However, the preparations, the advocacy work and the compensations vary from country to country. Compared to some other countries, Finland and Sweden have similar practices instructing and training the EAPPIs and they are well prepared for their time on the ground. However, there are differences in practical aspects such as compensation. The rent is paid by the organization and all the EAPPIs receive pocket money. However, life in Palestine can be surprisingly expensive, the prices are similar to Finland or Sweden, and for the EAPPIs who lived in the cities the amount of pocket money was quite modest, for the Finns it was approximately 500€ per month (Mäkilä, April 4, 2014). In Sweden, the EAPPIs received approximately 12 000 crowns (roughly 1350€), part of which they paid tax for. This effects to the range of participants. The bigger compensation allows not
only students and retired persons to participate easily but also people who are in the midst of their careers (Forsberg, May 2, 2014).

6.2.1 The Citizen of the World

The ethical core of the program and its unified view of all the program participants is emphasizing everyone’s right to the universal human rights. In one hand, some of the participants do not have any connection to Christianity or religion. In the other hand, for some the motivation to join lies in the Christian faith. The aspiration to be part of this program and address injustice is based on individual beliefs, principles and values (Bergholm).

The participants had both individual and collective motivations to take part. For Ragnar Svenserud it was an opportunity to return to the country he had visited first time before the 1967 war, for which he felt towards solidarity and wanted to return (April 30, 2014). Anders Forsberg, who have been working with conflict-related research, had for a long time wished to participate in the program, which he was already familiar with and had even visited a friend working as EAPPI. In addition to the personal reasons and motivations, both Forsberg and Svenserud addressed their aspiration to be able to engage and contribute to the peace building work. These aspirations and motivations are in line to the cosmopolitan idea of a person who is eager to move and see, but, first and foremost, values empathy and solidarity towards others (van der Veer 2002; Nussbaum 2003). Mäkilä described her motivation to participate arising from the interest of to know what is happening in the Middle East. She described Israeli–Palestinian conflict as forgotten conflict, people know it is there but it does not seem be solving itself. Her description addressed a following dimension:

I believe that things that are happening in the other side of the world are linked with us in some ways. As a citizen of the world I have some kind of responsibility to know what is happening, and if I can affect the state of things somehow I want to do it.
(Mäkilä, an unauthorized translation10)

Mäkilä’s approach is line with Nussbaum’s concept of the citizen of the world, and how one can act it out. Already in 2003 Nussbaum recognized that the information revolution is multiplying the possibilities to act as a world citizen (p. 135). For example, by giving financial support to Human Rights Watch for their work to improve the lives of thousands of

---

10 "Olen sitä mieltä, että vaikka ne asiat tapahtuvat siellä, nykyään tässä maailmassa kaikki asiat ovat jollain tavalla linkittyneitä toisiinsa ja koen että maailman kansalaisena minulla on jonkinlainen velvollisuus tietää asioista ja jos pystyn jotenkin vaikuttamaan niin haluan tehdä sen.”
(female) orphans in China, one is participating in shaping of the world (Ibid.). The EAPPIs are committed to advocacy work also after their time in Palestine. They are to share their experiences to make the conflict more visible. Mäkilä pointed out that there are so many people who do not understand what is going on in the occupied Palestinian territories.

6.2.2 Come and See

According to Mäkilä, the aim of the program became very clear during the training week and the role of international law and human rights were addressed as the most important aspect. Furthermore, it was emphasized that EAPPIs are in Palestine as observers – not to stand on the frontlines and save to Palestinians. The purpose of the program is rather to show solidarity and raise awareness of the situation. Forsberg elaborated this by bringing up the aspect of Come and see. He pointed out how the program has larger impact for Westerners than it has for Palestinians. The point is to see, to understand and to tell about the situation. Furthermore, he added that one cannot really understand the realities of the occupation without visiting the place. In his article, Forsberg describes the harsh reality that people should see and understand:

The Israeli settlement in Tel Rumeida was founded in 1984 when a group of Israeli families placed barracks there and moved into them. The Israeli government approved the building of permanent housing in 1998, and today there are several apartment houses, which have parking space and small gardens. We are talking with Palestinian families who live in the area. They tell us how the entrances to their yards are being blocked, how their lands are confiscated, and how the settlers, who are used to moving around the area, are constantly threatening them with violence and threats. In every street corner, there are Israeli soldiers.

(Forsberg, 2014, an unauthorized translation11)

The everyday realities are important. One of the work tasks that Svenserud’s group had was to be in at checkpoint three mornings in a week. They were there during the rush hour, between 4 a.m. and 7 a.m., when 5500 to 6000 people cross. He described the atmosphere at the checkpoint:

---

Of course I stand out from the crowd. Some people recognize my working vest and greet me with appreciation. Others are more reserved like they would be wondering: “Why are you doing this?”

“Do something”, said a woman to me in turning. I can read the same words in so many faces: “Do something!” I see and I hear. During one hour and twenty minutes I share their sense of humiliation. But can I really understand their experience? How can I mediate this experience? Nevertheless, it is exactly what they wish I can do.

(Svenserud, 2014, an unauthorized translation)

The important discourses of the EAPPI program are based on impartiality and neutrality. The EAPPIs are there to observe and to show solidarity. As the previous quotes illustrate, the reality is harsh. However, they also reveal important aspects of the conflict and the challenges towards peace building. They lean towards cosmopolitan moral principles but also address the structural violence within the situation. “Do something!” is the fundamental message, and here the normative approach is challenged with the more institutional aspiration, which refers to develop constitutional framework to realize universal human rights (see Habermas 2011).

6.2.3 Advocacy Work

Advocacy work is an important part of the program and there are some practical differences between Finland and Sweden. The Swedish participants are to create a list of approximately 200 persons, including family members, friends, colleagues and different civil society actors, to whom they send their blog articles during their stay in the oPt. It is also noteworthy that the capability to carry out meaningful advocacy work is considered in the recruiting process. These contacts are additionally important in the advocacy work EAPPIs carry out after their return (Forsberg). According to Svenserud, the people in the list appreciated these articles since through them able to get an idea of life in the oPt. Finnish participants have their own blogs and are using social media for spreading information: all the posts are available in Finnish EAPPI’s Facebook page (Bergholm). These practices are a part of creation of networks, which are constructed within and beyond the program. People outside the program are thus able to come and see the reality of the peace building efforts.

The participants are also committed to practical work when they return home. In Sweden the EAPPIs carry out in total 10 lectures, events etc. in six months after returning home. In Finland this is to be done during one year. The system is a bit more flexible and individually formed: the time frame is more dependent of the content. In both cases, the focus in the recruitment process is to find people who can enhance the advocacy work in productive way (Bergholm, Forsberg and Svenserud).

While the practices can be flexible, the language of the advocacy work has to follow discourses used in the program. For example, the term apartheid wall is not to be used. Bergholm elaborates this by explaining why the term is problematic. On the one hand, it is misleading since it is strongly associated with South Africa. On the other hand, people do not know so much about the Israeli-Palestinian conflict and the term apartheid actually takes the focus away from the fact that there is an actual wall going through the country. In its communication FCA stresses the unique situation in Palestine, the terminology that it chooses to use is aimed not to make political statements (Bergholm). The global concerns of universal human rights and the local realities in Palestine follow the discourses established by the program.

These choices of the words determines to a great extent discourses used in the program and advocacy work. Moreover, a crucial aspect is that in the EAPPIs’ blogs have a disclaimers from responsible organizations, which state that the opinions and views are personal, not necessarily corresponding to the values of the program (SEAPPI, 2014, Notes from The West Bank, 2014). This approach gives the organizations an opportunity to dissociate themselves from sensitive topics since there are many critical readers. However, in Sweden, all blog articles are checked before publishing (Svenserud). This method still allows the EAPPIs to share their experiences in variety of ways as representatives of program. In Finland, the approach is not as strict: the articles are not always read through before publishing. The participants are expected to share the normative framework of the program, already in the recruitment process the organizers aim to find people who would advocate the values of the program.

13 The Finns are writing on various blog platforms while the Swedes on the official SEAPPI site.
6.2.4 A Cross in the Back of the Working Vest

The program is run by the WCC but it does not represent a unified view on religion. This does not mean that religion is absent. EAPPIs have a cross on the back of their working vests and represent a Christian organizations – according to Forsberg there is no a need to explain their religious views since they are anyway perceived as Christians.

The important aspect of the program is that its participants have different views on religion. For example, Svenserud, who is a priest, questioned whether the EAPPI program differs from the work of other NGOs if the role of religion is not acknowledged? Furthermore, Forsberg points out that in Palestine people do not ask whether one is religious but what one’s religion is. Mäkilä was surprised how devout Christians some of the participants were. For example, it was very meaningful to some of her group members to go to church on Sundays, which for the others was one of their work tasks.

The religious discourses and narratives become complex and portray different aspects of Christianity that can be followed also by non-religious participants. The interviews point to different experiences how the role of religion is experienced. For most of the time they are indistinguishable from the cosmopolitan principles of justice, right, reason and empathy advocated by scholars of cosmopolitanism (Appiah 2007, Nussbaum, 2003, Kuper 2005). Sometimes they become intertwined: the symbolic meaning of the working vest with a cross is evident but it like Forsberg points out, the EAPPIs are active in a society where religion is not a lifestyle but a cultural fact.

The EAPPI program demonstrates how practices and abstract values can be related. It also gives an indicator of the complexity of the faith-based peace building and development work. Next I shall discuss the how normative frameworks influence the conduct of the institutions.

6.3 Institutional Approach: This is Not a No Man’s Land

Both the Church of Sweden and Finn Church Aid state that the Universal Declaration on Human Rights of the United Nations (1948) and other, more specific declarations associated with it, are inclusive to and provide principles and frameworks to guide international development and cooperation (Religion & Development 2012, p. 14).

Some theoreticians of cosmopolitanism emphasize the constitutional frame, not just abstract values (Caine 2010, Habermas 2011, Held 2005, 2003). In similar way, Held argues that the United Nation’s Declaration of Human Rights is not a cosmopolitan utopia since it can be
seen as an essential foundation for global justice. The faith-based development work has also its moral dilemmas, since, in general, human rights are “consistent with biblical perspectives and priorities, they are not ‘owned’ by Christians” (Religion & Development 2012, p. 14). Historically, in certain times and places, churches have not been promoters of human rights and selected passages of the Bible and other religious texts have been used to deny equal human rights to women or to justify the use of violence (Ibid. p. 14-15).

However, religions play an important role in the application and demonstration of human rights and provide new components that complement the legal approach (Religion & Development 2012, p. 15). This distinction is explicitly mentioned in some of the key documents and the role of dialogue is emphasized:

Many people, especially in non-western countries, do not base their concept of rights on any human authority or source in the first instance and for many religious believers a moral-spiritual approach is more important and convincing than a moral-legal one. (Religion & Development 2012, p. 15)

In this sense, the human rights discourse is built upon religious values and norms. The abstract values are replaced with the institutional approach and the Christian organizations are advocating for these values. This idea is elaborated by Amartya Sen (2003) who argues that justice, right, reason and love for humanity should not be interpreted as uniquely Western values. Furthermore, Sen points out how the existence of classical literature on justice, tolerance and freedom in non-Western nations contributes to the acknowledgment of the discourse of justice but does not diminish the need to respect them. Geography is not a defining factor: not all people in the West respect these values (p. 116-118).

The organizations that I have studied are aware of the problem of conflating Christian values with universal human rights. This is apparent in the discourses they use in their work since the expressions are carefully formulated. In the Religion & Development discussion paper it is stated that the role of religion brings in an “understanding of justice that goes clearly beyond law issues and includes a possibility of transformation and the dimension of forgiveness or reconciliation” (Religion & Development 2012, p. 15). Furthermore, “dialogical openness to other religious and cultural traditions can bring new perspectives to rights-based development work” (Ibid.).

Appiah (2007) approaches these themes with an emphasis of the role of the nation-state. When its existence is accepted it has a special responsibility for our own life and justice but
we also have to play our part to ensure that all states respect the rights and meet the needs of their citizens (p. 163). Even though the definition of nation-state can be ambiguous in variety of ways, and cannot really be applied to the state of Palestine, Appiah’s argument of the state’s responsibility illustrates the difficult situation in the case of Israel and Palestine. The realities in occupied Palestinian territories are exemplifying the need for global justice and safeguarding the rights of the Palestinians. The following story, necessary to be quoted in full length, portrays the many sides of the conflict and the existence of the structural violence:

On our village tour two days ago we met a Palestinian man, who is living in a double cage for several years. Roughly, his visible cage is about 70x50m big. Surrounded by 8m tall wall, fences and settlements from all directions, he has no other choice than to live in his house. The Israeli authority has offered him another house if he leaves, but in that case he would betray Palestinians. Leaving is not an option for him.

While visiting him I felt that he had become sort of “a tourist attraction”. NGOs, internationals, the Palestinian and Israeli authority, all “trying to solve his problem” with no option of removing the wall from the remaining piece of his land. At the moment the only way out of his visible cage is a key soldiers gave him 2 years ago. For the other, invisible cage, there is no key. He welcomes his visitors with a cup of coffee and introduces his small garden or what is left of it. Before he had a very successful business in gardening on the land he lost to the settlers.

This reminds me of Danis Tanović’s movie No Man’s Land. In the movie a land mine has been buried beneath wounded Bosniak soldier Cera, by the Bosnian Serbs; should he make any move, it would be fatal. After several attempts by UNPROFOR, media etc. to resolve this situation, it is found that the mine cannot be defused. Cera is left alone and desolate in the trenches, still immobilized by the mine.

The only difference I find is that this cage is not situated on No man’s land. This land belongs to a Palestinian man.

(Mäkilä, 2013)

What Mäkilä describes is a reality of a Palestinian man for whom international laws and global institutional frameworks have failed. However, the narrative points at the failure of the nation-state as a provider of a possible solution. From the cosmopolitan ethical and institutional perspective, the failure of the nation-state to protect its citizens becomes a responsibility of all of us in the case of a weak or non-existing nation-state whether “the
reason they fail their citizens is that they lack sources, providing sources can be part of that collective obligation” (Appiah 2007, p. 163-164). It is analytically important to distinguish between national and global frameworks for they are associated with different demands and discourses.

The important aspect of the development work the Church of Sweden, FCA and EAPPI program strive after is strongly based on the demands of the international community to act upon the situation, use the legal avenues more effectively and, moreover, to take responsibility of globally disadvantaged human beings. The Church of Sweden summarizes its position in following way:

The Church of Sweden takes an active role in issues of sustainable development, peace, democracy and human rights based on the equal value and rights of all people. The Church of Sweden’s international advocacy work targets those with economic and political power in Sweden, the EU and the UN, and aims to bring about long-term, sustainable change. (Together for a Just World 2013, p. 9)

The Church of Sweden acknowledges the need and importance of the institutional frameworks within the peace building and development work, and addresses ‘those with economic and political power’. Within the normative framework of the aid work the discourse of power is significant, especially, in the case of Israeli–Palestinian conflict with its long and complex history. This can be summarized with Nussbaum’s (2003) idea that we must love all humanity but there needs to be an international community, which acts upon the ideal that all people are equal worth. Institutions always consist of human actors with their unique experiences and histories. Both sides are put into balance in the Religion & Development discussion paper (2012):

In a personal perspective this motivates solidarity and compassion; in a more structural and systemic perspective this motivates the struggle for social justice. (p. 11)

This struggle for social justice can take many forms. I discussed earlier the EAPPI program with an emphasis on advocacy work for international solidarity and global justice. In the final part of my analysis, I focus on how economical factors tie together persons and institutions in global trade networks.
6.4 Campaigns against Israeli Goods Produced in the Occupied Palestine Territories

Europe has taken the stance that Israeli settlements are illegal. However, Europe has been accepting imports from these settlements and the products are mislabeled as “Made in Israel”. These products are sold in many stores in Europe. The existing EU consumer protection legislation grants consumers a right to be able to make informed purchasing decisions. This right is denied when the products are labeled incorrectly, and because of this many consumers are unconsciously supporting the settlements and violations of human rights (Trading Away Peace 2012, p. 7).

Finn Church Aid and the Church of Sweden both have campaigns against Israeli goods produced in the occupied Palestine territories (oPt). They are based on the aspect of illegality of the settlements and the rights of the consumers to have access to correct information (Svenska kyrkan Internationellt arbete, 2014).

6.4.1 FCA: Conscious Purchasing Decisions Are Defending Human Rights

The Finnish campaign was active during 2012-2013, and was launched after the publication of the report Forbidden Fruits – The Connections of Companies Operating in Finland to the Illegal Settlements in Israel, which Finnwatch had been commissioned to do for FCA, and was published in March 2012. The report explored the complex networks and connections of companies and corporations with the illegal settlements. The report found that there were over 30 companies in Finland that had those connections. The findings were striking since according to the Finnish Customs’ statistics there are hardly any products imported to Finland from the illegal settlements (Vartiala, Pöyhönen and Purje 2012, p. 5).

However, the report did not lead to any proceedings from the government side; the Ministry for Foreign Affairs stated that it would not interfere with the trade relations between companies. After this, FCA’s Labeling the Origins campaign (Alkuperä merkkaa) was launched and the organization actively challenged the state regulations by demanding the correct labeling of the products (Huttunen, 2013).

The FCA’s campaign was aimed to activate consumers to demand their rights to know the origins of the products and to be able to choose those, which are not supporting the illegal settlements, seen as a violation towards human rights and an obstacle to peace building in Middle East (EAPPI, 2014). Through the campaign, FCA was acting as an agent of justice by mobilizing First World consumer power and campaigning for regulations and reforms that contribute to justice in a weak state (O’Neill 2005, p. 47-48), in this case Palestine. The
Finnish consumer power was mobilized by advocating the idea how a responsible consumer avoids the goods produced in the settlements. The campaign proposed that if the origin of the product is unclear it should be left in the store. Furthermore, it was phrased, that with conscious purchasing decisions consumers are defending the rights and freedoms of the people living under the occupation (EAPPI, 2014).

In the campaign the concrete everyday actions were emphasized. For example, the consumers were encouraged to approach the local storekeepers with a pre-filled customer feedback letters; to sign a petition to different ministers and send e-mails to shops, and the authorities who can influence the situation. The campaign had an educational component dealing with several issues of illegal settlements: how they affect Palestinian people and are an obstacle to peace building but it also expressed the need for rules and regulations. By stating that “the Israeli–Palestinian conflict is not as far away as you think, through trade it is in Finland and in the stores near you” (unauthorized translation14), the campaign brought the conflict into a local level and offered a possibility for consumers to advocate for change and justice. This aspect of the campaign is closely related to approach within cosmopolitan theory, which concentrates on the concept of “the ethical and political space” and how it is referring to the recognition of people’s equal moral worth, their active agency, and furthermore, what is needed for development and autonomy (Held 2005, p. 194). In this case, Palestinian and Finnish consumers occupy the shared ethical and political space, not in the geographical location of Palestine but mediated through economic transactions.

The Finnish campaign was strongly criticized. For example, the European Coalition for Israel accused it being a boycott against Israel (EAPPI, 2014). FCA responded to this criticism by stating that the campaign is not a boycott towards Israel or its legitimate products. Furthermore, FCA stated that racism, anti-Semitism or islamophobia are not tolerated within the campaign or outside of it (EAPPI, 2014).

In the campaign there are several cosmopolitan ethical principles to be recognized. For example, by referring to the human rights and international law it is showing the aspiration for justice, and why the label of origin should be included in laws, rights and responsibilities. Furthermore, Aaro Rytkönen, the Director of Policy and Advocacy in FCA, stated that Israel is not a special case for the organization but the issue of illegal settlements is regarded from Palestinian a point of view and how their lives are affected by them (Huttunen, 2013).

14 "Israelin ja palestiinalaisten välinen konflikti ei ole kovin kaukana. Se ulottuu yritystoiminnan kautta Suomeen ja Sinun läheisessä kauppoihin.”
The discourses and narratives of the campaign are supporting the cosmopolitan ideals of the value of human life by referring to the responsibilities towards others, shared human values and the universal human rights (Appiah 2007, Kaldor 2003, Nussbaum 2003). Furthermore, to demand that the companies and retail chains should acknowledge their responsibility to provide the correct and complete information of the products they are selling is another practical perspective and illustrates how the responsibility should be shared by different actors in order to create a change. The campaign operated on many fronts and the universal values were not separate from the concrete actions. The ideas of connection and connectivity are fundamental aspects in the campaign and additionally close to cosmopolitan positions. By advocating closeness and interrelatedness the conflict becomes ours as well and we can play our part.

6.4.2 The Church of Sweden: Act against Occupation in Palestine

The Church of Sweden’s Labeling the Origins campaign (Ursprungsmärkning av varor från illegala bosättningar) was launched with the Christmas campaign (Julkampanjen) in 2013 and is still active. In many respects it is similar to the Finnish one, at its core it is about spreading information of the illegality of the occupation and its economic consequences. The consumers are encouraged to demand the shopkeepers to act in responsible way and to be able to demonstrate the correct origins of their products (Svenska Kyrkan Internationellt arbete, 2014). In their work, the Church of Sweden is referring to the Trading Away Peace: How Europe helps sustain illegal Israeli settlements report (2012), which provides facts of the situation in the oPt, how the EU is importing settlement products and what rules and regulations should be adapted. Furthermore, the report was the first one ever to gather statistics of the exports from the Israeli settlements to the EU and to compare them to the Palestinian exports. The report showed that the EU exports 15 times more products from the illegal settlements than Palestine, worth around 2 billion crowns per year, compared to 130 million crowns from Palestine (Svenska kyrkan, 2012).

In its campaign, the Church of Sweden states that it wants the consumers to be able to buy Israeli products without risking purchasing products from the illegal settlements. The campaign is additionally encouraging the consumers to participate to change the situation but is not in principle against goods produced in the state of Israel (Svenska Kyrkan Internationellt arbete, 2014). The existence of the campaign was motivated by stating that the government of Sweden, the EU, the UN, and even the U.S. agree that the Israeli settlements in the oPt are not a legitimate part of Israel. Furthermore, the occupation and the growing
number of illegal settlements are seen as one of the biggest obstacles in achieving peace between Israel and Palestine. Moreover, according to the EU directive (2005/29/EC) a store is not allowed to promote or label products in a way that a consumer risks to purchase a product that she/he would like to avoid purchasing (Svenska Kyrkan Internationellt arbete, 2014).

The Church of Sweden has been criticized for its campaign and it has clarified its position in the Israeli–Palestinian conflict by affirming that it supports Israel and its internationally acknowledged borders as well as the state of Palestine situated in the Gaza Strip and the West Bank including East Jerusalem. The Church of Sweden’s international work is for and behalf of human rights and international law that are foundation for the creation of a better standard of living and sustainable peace. The church actors have emphasized that the Labeling the Origins campaign was just another way of conducting this work. To criticize Israel’s politics in the oPt is not the same as to question Israel’s legitimacy as a state or to acknowledge Israel’s right to protect itself (Lundby-Wedin and Hagelin, 2014).

The campaign and the stance towards Israeli–Palestinian conflict are very similar to the Finnish one. The ethical aspects of the conflict are raised and the approach can be interpreted as a cosmopolitan one since the importance of human rights and international law are emphasized. However, the question is not just about conflict in values. The significance and need for global frameworks is acknowledged and a model for cosmopolitan politics, which stand for multi-layered authority and strive for inclusion instead of exclusion persists (Kaldor 2003, p. 276-277). It is important to point out how the universal values are present in the both campaigns and the aspiration for cooperation from the authorities’ side is evident. The campaigns strive after sustainable change, an aspect that both actors advocate as integral to peace building.

The differences of the campaigns are in their timing and the structure of their organization. In Finland the FCA’s campaign is connected with EAPPI program and in Sweden it is managed by the Church of Sweden. The two actors operate in same networks but there has not been direct connection with the campaigns. The campaigns target same issues but they are not standardized in their form. For example, FCA’s campaign was created independently by the organization (Bergholm). However, both actors have participated in the making of the report

---

Trading Away Peace (2012), which discusses also the practical solutions and where the stance of organizations involved becomes very clear.

It is important to understand how the discourses of the campaigns are constructed. Both actors have made a decision not to use the term boycott. Bergholm points out that FCA and EAPPI pay attention to the use of terms. The Labeling the Origins campaign addresses the aspect of illegality of the settlements and human rights violations, and this fact should not be distorted with other political issues. The campaign encountered criticism especially in the beginning, and several religious actors were critical towards it. In these kinds of situations it important to use terms that have clear and stable definitions (Ibid.).

When the campaigns’ discourses are analyzed in this manner the ethical perspectives resemble those that I have argued are crucial in the cosmopolitan perspectives. Here, I have demonstrated briefly how the campaigns have been criticized and how the FCA and the Church of Sweden have been arguing for their cause. Those arguments strongly rely on the universal values and global frameworks and establish a normative framework to the campaigns.

6.4.3 Understanding Connectivity

As FCA states in its campaign, the Israeli–Palestinian conflict extends to the everyday life of people in Nordic countries. The SodaStream, which produces soda makers, carbonators, carbonating bottles and syrup flavors, has become infamous of its connection with the illegal settlements. In Finland the market share of the product is 90% and in Sweden more than one million households have it. According to the Finnish importer of SodaStream, Empire Finland, the manufacturing is located in China and Israel, and in Israel the other factory is located in Mishor Adumin, which is the industrial area of the Ma’ale Adumim’s settlement. However, since the SodaStream products are manufactured both in China and Israel, it is unclear which ones Finland receives (Vartiala, Pöyhönen and Purje 2012, p. 48-49).

According to the Finnwatch’s follow-up report, SodaStream continues its production in the illegal Israeli settlement,(2013) (SodaStream jatkaa toimintaansa Israelin laittomassa siirtokunnassa) SodaStream continues to have a factory in the Mishor Adumin but claims that the products from there are not imported to Nordic countries. However, it remains unclear where these products are imported to (Ibid).

To activate consumers the very idea of connection and politics must be established. What Bryant Simon (2011) calls a process of politicalization, means that the consumers need to
think about and recognize the connection between what they buy and the related worlds of production, labor, and exchange. The illusion of free choice needs to be challenged, and the interdependence acknowledged. Furthermore, the consumer choices, boycotting and not buying need to be shared in social media and amongst friends so the reasons behind the choices become known and intended results are actualized (p. 163).

However, as Simon (2011) points out, just to share information is not enough and in this way one can understand why Finn Church Aid’s and the Church of Sweden’s strategies have been successful. I argue that they could be described as consumer empowerment: the campaigns are spreading information about the occupation and why the correct labeling of the origins is important. Additionally, they encourage consumers to be active themselves and to demand that the Finnish and Swedish authorities should provide certifications that prove they are not selling products from the oPt, is giving consumers possibilities to participate and to make a difference. The most crucial point in the discussion of consumer responsibility is “the understanding of connectivity” (Simon 2011, p. 163).

SodaStream is a good way to illustrate this connectivity between consumers and other parts of the world since it is a popular brand and many Finns and Swedes own one. This approach was used at the Street Food Festival in Helsinki16, when Mäkilä and her friends, who have also been EAPPIs, had created the “Ethical water bar”. They had also been involved in the production of an anti-commercial called SodaScream17. In the “Ethical water bar” they were serving tap water without bubbles or human rights violations and spreading information about the settlements in the oPt. The event was not officially connected to Mäkilä’s advocacy work in EAPPI; however, it was a way for her to share her experience of the occupation. She told me that this event demonstrated how many people had purchased SodaStream and how little they actually knew about the product or the situation in general (Mäkilä).

Spreading information this way is an important way of advocating. As I have argued before, the fact is that companies that have their production in the settlements make substantial profits. “The Ethical water bar” is a good example of how people can support the political process of the labeling the origins; how they are promoting their own choices. Thus understanding the connectivity between the SodaStream and the illegal settlements becomes crucial. The consumers must be able to see that their choices “matter to people, places, and

---

16 Streat Helsinki Eats – Street Food Festival in Tori Quarters, 22 March 2014.
17 Mäkilä’s friends, Lea Pakkanen and Heli Pekkonen are part of the Bubble Trouble group that created an anti-commercial of SodaStream called SodaScream.
power” (Simon 2011, p.163). Furthermore, the knowledge that active and passive choices matter is significant. By buying a SodaStream product one is accidentally helping to sustain the illegal settlements in oPt. Moreover, consumers need to use different venues, like social media, to share reasons for their everyday choices. The knowledge, motivation, values and meanings can become normative guidelines that are shared and possibly adopted by more and more consumers.

6.4.4 A Cosmopolitan Cause?

FCA’s values and motivations in development work and in the Labeling the Origins campaign can be summarized in a following way:

Change requires tackling structural factors […] Sustainable change requires considering the roles of both rights-holders and duty-bearers and directing our action towards both of them. This means empowering people to exercise and claim their rights, and advocating or supporting the authorities and decision-makers to meet their obligations.

(Kirkon ulkomaanapu, 2014)

Both campaigns are legitimized through the illegality of the settlements and how they are violating human rights. Additionally, both emphasize a practical approach and are reaching out to consumers by pointing out their responsibility and possibility to affect the situation. This is a subtle way to approach the structural violence that exists in the Israeli-Palestinian conflict (see Galtung 1969). The campaigns are also embracing the national and international framework to address their demands. The discourse of human rights is a cosmopolitan cause since it is addressing the international community to realize shared human values and to act upon them in local and global contexts (Nussbaum 2003, p. 5-7).

An important aspect of the campaigns is that before them, the international community did not have concrete ways or tools to work against the occupation of Palestine (Forsberg). Furthermore, the campaigns, which are based on the aspect of illegality, are not as controversial as the BDS movement, which targets directly the state of Israel (Ibid.).

The campaigns use terms and expressions like ‘an ethical consumer’ and ‘the right of consumers not to purchase products from illegal settlements’. The important method is also to encourage the consumers to act against human rights violations. In this sense, the campaigns are creating an idea of a consumer who recognizes global responsibilities; realizes the connection between the settlements and their negative consequences in Palestinians’ lives;
and is willing to act upon these values and ideals. This kind of consumer is expected to adopt the cosmopolitan ethics and principles in a variety of ways. Furthermore, “Who must do what for whom?” is evidently a relevant question and can be answered to some extent within the campaigns’ context (see Kuper 2005). However, the approach the Finn Church Aid and the Church of Sweden is using is formulated rather as ‘Who can do what to whom?’ when they are targeting the consumers, and ‘must’ is rather towards the official actors. Portrayed in this way, the ethical consumer is addressing a truly cosmopolitan cause by acting upon the injustice and the suffering of fellow human being. Throughout the campaign, consumers can be seen promoting “cosmopolitanism from below” (Appadurai 2011, p. 32) by recognizing how the choices are connecting them with the wider world, and that those values that guide their own lives can be seen as independent from familiar people and immediate circumstances. In this way the values and norms can be seen as guiding their behavior.

The traditional idea of a cosmopolitan is rather elitist. However, as I have argued in this study this view is limited. For example, to describe an ethical consumer through cosmopolitan characteristics I am referring to an active, ethical and empathetic person who has an interest towards the wider world. The idea of collective future, which is globally shared, is a relevant point here (Beck in Vertovec and Cohen 2002, p.1). By participating and advocating for the correct labeling of the origins one is including the realities of the others into one’s consumer decisions in everyday life. Consumers are reminded of the shared future, of the possibilities and the consequences. Why are the settlements harmful? Why is campaign built around the human rights and international law? Furthermore, the consequences of consumer choices are pointed out and challenged, and in this way the connection between us and them is made.

Both campaigns address global governance and are strongly representative of cosmopolitan principles. In short, the role of faith or religion is not very clear, and the discourses of the campaigns do not refer to this either. However, Bergholm points out that supporting and working for human rights is a fundamental Christian cause as well as a general humanitarian cause. The role of religion is not underlined but it should also be noted that FCA and the Church of Sweden are representative for faith-based development and advocacy work.

The Finnish campaign 2012-2013 has been successful and there are already concrete results. The Finnish S Group18, network of companies, started to demand that Israeli importers

---

18 S Group comprises over 1,600 outlets in Finland.
provide the label of origin, and now for example the Ahava Cosmetics are correctly labeled as originating from Mitzpe Shalem, which is an illegal settlement. Additionally, Kesko Food decided not to sell fruits and vegetables from the illegal settlements (Finnwatch, 2013).

Now there are plans to continue the campaign and to direct it towards the newly elected Finnish members of the European Parliament. The aim is to lobby them to advocate a new EU law so that the labeling the origins would become mandatory. At the moment, the absence of the law is a significant obstacle to enhance the correct labeling of the products from illegal Israeli settlements (Bergholm, 2014).

The campaigns address the structural inequalities and promote the responsibilities on an individual, national and international level. The cosmopolitan ethical perspectives are present in these ideas; consumers are identifying the universal values, acting upon the ideal of that fellow human beings matter and advocating for the rights and responsibilities (Appiah 2007, Nussbaum 2003, Kuper 2005, Appadurai 2011).

These are values that FCA is building its aid work around but they are clearly represented in the Church of Sweden’s campaign as well. However, as I emphasized earlier (p. 19-23) the Church of Sweden uses more biblical references to describe its development work. Therefore, it is very interesting that the two actors have driven such similar campaigns.

7 Conclusion

In this study, the work of the Church of Sweden, Finn Church Aid and EAPPI have been approached within normative framework and discussed from various cosmopolitan theoretical perspectives. Discourse and narrative analysis have proved to be fruitful methods to approach these issues. The abstract values and concrete actions are the two sides of the coin in the complex practices of peace building and development work. The comparative perspective has created an understanding of how networks are formed and how the similar themes, narratives and discourses are present in the work of different organizations. The Labeling the Origins campaigns and the EAPPI program are interesting cases of different organizational structures entangled with overlapping discourses. This also points towards the understanding that the perspective of networks is more significant than one concentrating on countries or actors.

Cosmopolitan values can be identified in the discourses of the FBOs. Moreover, their work is based on them and the need for global framework is strongly advocated. In this sense, the comparison of cosmopolitan and Christian discourses provides novel perspective on peace
building and aid work. The previous research on Christian ethics and approaches to humanitarian aid and development work has illustrated the crucial role of religion in the global aid work. However, as my study shows, the role of religion can be ambiguous; cosmopolitan and Christian discourses become intertwined with it in various ways. The approaches that explicitly combine Christian and cosmopolitan ethics should be studied to a greater extent in order to extend the discussion and analysis of the consensual processes in peace building and development work.

WORDCOUNT:16118
References


**Internet Sources**


EAPPI, Ekumeeninen kumppanuusohjelma palestiinalaisalueilla ja Israelissa, 2014. Alkuperä

EAPPI, Ekumeeninen kumppanuusohjelma palestiinalaisalueilla ja Israelissa, 2014. 100%
vaikuttavaa. URL = <http://www.eappi.fi/merkkaa/100_vaiuttavaa>, viewed on February 14,
2014.

EAPPI, Ekumeeninen kumppanuusohjelma palestiinalaisalueilla ja Israelissa, 2014. Alkuperä
merkkaa-kampanjasta levitetään virheellistä tietoa. URL =
<http://www.eappi.fi/ajankohtaista/alkupera_merkkaa-
kampanjasta_levitetaan_virheellista_tietoa>, viewed on February 14, 2014.

Ekumeniska följeslagarprogrammet i Palestina och Israel (SEAPPI). Hem.

Ekumeniska följeslagarprogrammet i Palestina och Israel (SEAPPI). Följeslagare. URL =

Europa Summaries of EU Legislations. Consumer Information. URL =
<http://europa.eu/legislation_summaries/consumers/consumer_information/l32011_en.htm>>,

Finn Church Aid (2009), The Invisibles Campaign of Finn Church Aid: Policy Brief III
Inclusion and Human Rights as a Key to Development and Security Policy, URL =
<http://www.kirkonulkomaanapu.fi/filebank/5171KUA_Nakymattomat_policy_brief_3_2009
.pdf>, viewed on February 12, 2014.

laittomassa siirtokunnassa” URL = <http://finnwatch.org/fi/uutiset/90-finnwatchin-
seurantatutkimus-sodastream-jatkaa-toimintaansa-israelin-laittomassa-siirtokunnassa>,
viewed on February 12, 2014.

Foundation for Middle East Peace. Israeli Settler Population 1972-2006. URL = <
http://www.fmep.org/settlement_info/settlement-info-and-tables/stats-data/israeli-settler-


The Church of Sweden (2013), Together for a Just World - the Church of Sweden’s international work. URL = <https://www.svenskakyrkan.se/international>, viewed on February 20, 2014.


**Interviews:**


Telephone interview with Anders Forsberg, Malmö, May 2, 2014.

Telephone interview with Elina Mäkilä, Malmö, April 4, 2014.

Telephone interview with Ragnar Svenserud, Malmö, April 30, 2014.
# Glossary of Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>APRODEV</td>
<td>The Association of World Council of Churches related Development Organizations in Europe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BDS</td>
<td>Boycott, Divestment and Sanctions Campaign</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CA</td>
<td>Christian Aid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EAPPI</td>
<td>The Ecumenical Accompaniment Programme in Palestine and Israel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECHO</td>
<td>European Community Humanitarian Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FBO</td>
<td>Faith-based Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FCA</td>
<td>Finn Church Aid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HAP</td>
<td>Humanitarian Accountability Partnership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INGO</td>
<td>International Non-governmental Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MNC</td>
<td>Multinational Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-governmental Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RNGO</td>
<td>Religious Non-governmental Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEAPPI</td>
<td>Swedish Ecumenical Accompaniment Programme in Palestine and Israel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TNC</td>
<td>Transnational Corporation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WCC</td>
<td>World Council of Churches</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 1: Themes of the Interviews

Why did you want to participate in the program?
How was it like to be an EAPPI in Palestine?
What kind of training was there beforehand?
Was there compensation for the work or just ‘pocket money’?
How did you feel like writing blog posts?
How did you experience the role of religion in the program?
Do you know about the Labeling the Origins campaign?
What is the connection between Labeling the Origins campaign and EAPPI?
Why is Labeling the Origins campaign constructed in this way?
What is the role of religion in the campaign?